

INTER-AMERICAN INSTITUTE OF HUMAN RIGHTS

SECOND INTER-AMERICAN REPORT  
ON HUMAN RIGHTS EDUCATION

*A Study in 19 Countries*

Development of school curricula and textbooks

San José – December 2003

© 2004 Inter-American Institute of Human Rights.  
San José. First Edition in English. All rights reserved

Total or partial reproduction of the materials published herein is permitted, provided that they are not altered in any way, that credit is duly assigned and that a copy of the publication or reproduction is sent to the editor

***Production team in charge of this publication:***

Diego Iturralde	<i>Coordinator of the Applied Research Unit</i>
Ana María Rodino	<i>Coordinator of the Pedagogical Unit</i>
Marisol Molestina	<i>Coordinator of the Information and Editorial Services Unit</i>
Giselle Mizrahi	<i>Consultant in charge of research</i>
Editorama	<i>Printer</i>
Sergio Guillén	<i>English translation</i>
Nick Partridge	<i>Comparison and Revision in English</i>

Some of the information included in this publication was obtained through the efforts of the following local consultants, several of whom have been participants in courses offered by the IHR.

Argentina, Francisco Scarfó; Brazil, Marcia Canario; Bolivia, José Eduardo Rojas; Colombia, Sandra Morello; Costa Rica, Giselle Mizrahi; Chile, Belisario Magaña; Ecuador, Cecilia Lazo; El Salvador, Zulema Lara; Guatemala, René Linares; Haiti, Patrick Camille; Mexico, Citlalin Castañeda; Nicaragua, Carlos Emilio López; Panama, José Antonio Grenard; Paraguay, Aristide Escobar; Peru, Norma Rojas; The Dominican Republic, Institute of Human Rights of Santo Domingo; Uruguay, Lilián Celiberti; Venezuela, María Isabel Bertone.

The systematization and drafting of this report and its annexes were the responsibility of Ana María Rodino, Diego Iturralde, Giselle Mizrahi, and Alexandra Armijo Fortín.

The research program for the active promotion of human rights, of which this report is a result, is financed by the **Ford Foundation**.

**Inter-American Institute of Human Rights**  
P.O. Box 10.081-1000 San José, Costa Rica  
Phone (506) 234-0404 Fax: (506) 234 – 0955  
E-mail: [uinformacion@iidh.ed.cr](mailto:uinformacion@iidh.ed.cr)  
[www.iidh.ed.cr](http://www.iidh.ed.cr)

## INDEX

<b>Foreword</b> .....	5
<b>Section I: Measuring Progress in Human Rights Education</b> .....	7
Introduction .....	7
Nature of this report .....	8
Justification.....	9
Conceptual framework .....	12
Methodological aspects.....	13
Sources of information consulted .....	18
<b>Section II: Analysis of the results of the Investigation</b> .....	29
Inclusion of contents on human rights and constitutional guarantees.....	29
Inclusion of contents on justice, State Institutions and the Rule of Law .....	35
Inclusion of contents on democracy, the right to vote, elections and political and ideological pluralism .....	38
Inclusion of contents on education in values.....	43
Inclusion of contents regarding gender equity .....	47
Inclusion of contents regarding ethnic diversity.....	51
Inclusion of contents regarding the interaction between civil society and the State.....	55
<b>Section III: Conclusions</b> .....	59
<b>Section IV: Recommendations</b> .....	63
<b>Annex on CD-Rom</b> .....	65

## INDEX OF TABLES

Table 1: Protocol of San Salvador .....	7
Table 2: International instruments with HRE contents ratified in 2003 .....	11
Table 3: Matrix used for the preparation of the I Report .....	14
Table 4: Matrix used for the preparation of this II Report.....	17
Table 5: Documents consulted to identify curriculum guidelines.....	19
Table 6: Subjects and grades analyzed for 1990 .....	22
Table 7: Subjects and grades analyzed for 2003 .....	22
Table 8: Textbooks consulted for the preparation of this Report .....	23

## Foreword

Education in Human Rights is the foremost task of our democracies and is today a right in the Americas. As such, it entails the obligation of the State to ensure an education and learning that incorporates the knowledge, values, attitudes and competences necessary to educate citizens who are aware that they are the subject of rights and responsibilities.

This Second Inter-American Report on Human Rights Education, which refers to the 19 countries that have signed the Additional Protocol to the American Convention on Human Rights in the Area of Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, (Protocol of San Salvador), has verified the substantial trends outlined in the First Report, by showing a progressive increase in the human rights content of the curricula for children and youths in the hemisphere. This corroboration of progress in the educational field is encouraging, because human rights and their effective exercise must begin in early childhood.

The debate on the manner of approaching human rights in the educational systems of the Americas has taken on new strength, beginning with the very specific curricular initiatives of the last decade of the 20th century. We can see, among other important findings, the recent progress reflected in the educational content on gender equality and equal opportunity. This fundamental change is the result of the solid convictions and the strong efforts of the human rights movement, especially the international movement for women's rights. Variations and noteworthy trends are also confirmed regarding the recognition and respect for the different peoples and cultures that make up the human tapestry of the Americas.

This Second Inter-American Report underscores how knowledge of human rights is – and must be – the main instrument in the struggle against multiple forms of discrimination, in order to encourage every effort to prevent violence and promote the exercise of freedom and democracy in the region.

This study compares the situations prevailing in 1990 and 2003 with regard to the incorporation of human rights values, principles and content – viewed in terms of seven fundamental themes – in the official documents that lay out the curriculum, the course programs of school subjects, and the textbooks used in the classrooms. It also pays attention to the usage of language and images, to the examples, illustrations and activities set forth in the educational texts for our students in the 10-to-16-year age group.

The results can be considered challenging, since they show a positive trend in the adoption of positive legal, institutional and pedagogic measures in accordance with Article 13.2 of the Protocol of San Salvador: *“Everyone has the right to education ... education should be directed towards the full development of the human personality and human dignity and should strengthen respect for human rights, ideological pluralism, fundamental freedoms, justice and peace. (The States) further agree that education ought to enable everyone to participate effectively in a democratic and pluralistic society and achieve a decent existence and should foster understanding, tolerance and friendship among all nations and all racial, ethnic or religious groups and promote activities for the maintenance of peace...”*

For this study, local consultants, most of them former participants in the Interdisciplinary Course, collaborated in the gathering of information for each country. The research process was guided

and followed-up through an electronic list, while the systematization, processing and final drafting of the report was done by IIHR staff.

The preparation of these series of Reports and the Active Promotion Strategy for Human Rights Education are made possible by the generous support of the Ford Foundation.

**Roberto Cuéllar**  
**Executive Director**

**December 2003**

## Section I: Measuring Progress in Human Rights Education

### Introduction

This is the Second Report prepared by the Inter-American Institute of Human Rights (IIHR), as part of its Active Promotion Strategy for Human Rights Education (HRE). It deals with the countries that have *signed or ratified* the Additional Protocol to the American Convention of Human Rights in area of Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (Protocol of San Salvador), with the exception of Suriname<sup>1</sup>. As in the First Report of this series, published in December of 2002, its objective is to identify those trends that may constitute *progress* in the recognition and the guarantees of human rights education as a human right, as set forth in Article 13 of the Protocol and other international agreements.

Table 1: Protocol of San Salvador		
Country	Signing Date	Ratification Date
Argentina	1988	2003
Bolivia	1988	---
Brazil		1996
Chile	2001	---
Colombia		1997
Costa Rica	1988	1999
Dominican Rep	1988	---
Ecuador	1988	1999
El Salvador	1988	1995
Guatemala	1988	2000
Haiti	1988	---
Mexico	1988	1996
Nicaragua	1988	---
Panama	1988	1992
Paraguay	1996	1997
Peru	1988	1995
Suriname		1990
Uruguay	1988	1995
Venezuela	1989	---
Source: <a href="http://www.oas.org/main/main.asp?sLang=E&amp;sLink=http://www.oas.org/legal/legalen.htm">http://www.oas.org/main/main.asp?sLang=E&amp;sLink=http://www.oas.org/legal/legalen.htm</a>		

This Report is part of a four-year investigation. The First Report examined the legal framework that establishes and characterizes HRE in the domestic laws of these countries, with the idea of identifying trends in the changes from 1990 to 2001/2, in order to establish to what degree these trends constitute progress, setbacks or stagnation<sup>2</sup>.

This Report examines to what extent human rights have been incorporated into the administrative and programmatic elements that make up the school curricula, the course plans and programs of the subjects taught in elementary and high schools, and in the textbooks that are being used. The period covered by this study is the last decade of the 20<sup>th</sup> century and the first years of the 21<sup>st</sup>.

The next report will address the incorporation of HRE in the formation and training of teachers.

The reference period selected for these reports generally corresponds to several phenomena that are characteristic of our era: the reestablishment of democracy and/or the consolidation of democratic

institutions and their relative independence in various countries in the region; the adoption of constitutional, legal and administrative reforms; and the mobilization of civil society in favor of

<sup>1</sup> This Report does not include the results of the research concerning Suriname, because a series of difficulties delayed the research in that country and was not available at the time this report was prepared.

<sup>2</sup> The First HRE Report may be found in the CD-ROM annexed to this publication. It is also available at the Institute's Web site: [www.iidh.ed.cr](http://www.iidh.ed.cr).

the full application of human rights and the rule of law. It also coincides with the period between the last two population censuses, thus allowing any interested reader to make comparisons in relation to the general development indicators, particularly those concerning access to education. Finally, the period that makes up the scope of this study corresponds to the execution of educational reform programs and other structural reforms in most of the countries.

This effort by the IIHR aims to provide information to the bodies responsible for overseeing, promoting and protecting social, economic and cultural rights in the orbit of the Organization of American States, —as a “friendly, independent rapporteur”—to the relevant public sector bodies, to the civil organizations working in this field and to the international human rights community. It seeks to promote debate and evaluate the advances in human rights education, an issue that has seldom been studied in depth.

Even though the IIHR is not an official body of the Inter-American System but rather an autonomous international body<sup>3</sup>, the Organization of American States has repeatedly called for its cooperation with the Inter-American Commission for Human Rights, which is the body responsible for undertaking these functions of promotion and education, but which faces budgetary constraints for fulfilling its growing commitments in all the fields of its mandate<sup>4</sup>. With this series of reports, the Institute responds to this call and contributes with its experience to the work of the Commission.

## **Nature of this report**

The IIHR undertakes this investigation on the basis of its statutory mandate to carry out studies on human rights in the fulfillment of its mission as an institution devoted to teaching, research and promotion of human rights, in the framework of the American Convention of Human Rights. Without downplaying the overall structure of the global system for human rights protection and promotion, the Institute pays special attention to the development of standards derived from the norms that have emerged from the Inter-American System. It has done so with a multidisciplinary approach, taking into account the specific problems of the Americas<sup>5</sup>.

Even though there is already an internationally recognized practice by the different human rights protection bodies to accept parallel reports – called “shadow reports” – produced by civil society organizations with the objective of verifying and contrasting the facts and information provided by the States in their periodic reports, this Report is not intended to serve in that capacity. It is rather a proposal rooted in the IIHR’s own attributes and goals, as an organization geared at education in human rights, whose work does not involve judging the responsibilities of the States. It seeks to fashion tools that would allow the evaluation on an ongoing basis of the inclusion of human rights in the political and social life of the countries in the region, as a promise and obligation at the international level.

---

<sup>3</sup> The IIHR was created by the Inter-American Court of Human Rights on July 30, 1980 and given international status through an agreement between the Court and the Costa Rican Government as host country on November 30 of that same year.

<sup>4</sup> CF GA/RES. 1894 (XXXII-O/02), GA/RES. 1850 (XXXII-O/02).

<sup>5</sup> Statute of the Inter-American Institute of Human Rights, Art. 5.



This is not a report about the right to education. This is a report about the right to education in human rights. Therefore, it focuses on different objectives than those of other reports that have studied the level of fulfillment of the right to access to education without discrimination. It addresses one of the specific aspects of this service: the integration of pedagogic contents on human rights, and it should be read in conjunction with the other reports.

This Report does not recount violations to this right, nor does it merely address compliance of it. It refers to the progressive process of inclusion of these contents in the legal, administrative, pedagogic and didactic instruments that guide and affect education in everyday practice. This outlook – of progress – does not replace that of vigilance, denunciation and defense in the face of violations, nor does it seek to hide the setbacks in the achievement of desirable goals<sup>6</sup>. Ultimately, it aims to measure to what degree and at what rate the common objectives of attaining the rule of law and democracy are being achieved in a specific field. This common objective is to be understood as the point of equilibrium between the standards set forth in the international instruments, the norms adopted, the political and institutional practices by States and the peoples' aspirations.

The novelty of this approach rests in its potential to understand the matters of human rights as *processes* and not solely as *situations*; to identify the deficiencies and the means to overcome them over the medium and long terms; and to establish shared and complementary working priorities and strategies among the different stakeholders.

## Justification

Section 2 of Article 13 of the Protocol of San Salvador established the obligation of the States to provide an education with specific qualities, among which the following are specifically mentioned:

- That it is geared towards the full development of the human being and the sense of his/her dignity
- That it is directed at strengthening respect for human rights, ideological pluralism, fundamental freedoms, justice and peace
- That it offers to educate all persons to participate effectively in a democratic and pluralistic society
- That it favors understanding, tolerance and friendship among all nations and all racial, ethnic and religious groups
- That it promotes activities in favor of maintaining peace

Even though the Protocol of San Salvador becomes legally binding upon ratification by the State, each of the nineteen countries that have *either signed or ratified* it has an obligation to proactively design the legal and logistic grounds for promoting and protecting economic, social and cultural rights in all their dimensions. This includes a commitment to ratify the Protocol and the duty to

---

<sup>6</sup> This approach has been taken by the IIHR as a component of its institucional strategy since the year 2000 and it has been applied in exercises related to other sets of rights, such as the right of access to justice, political participation and freedom of expression.

progressively adapt internal laws, prepare public policies and launch activities that will fulfill its purposes.

The thirteen States that have ratified the Protocol also have the obligation specified in Article 19.2 of the Protocol, of presenting periodic reports to the OAS General Secretariat, which conveys them to the Inter-American Economic and Social Council and the Inter-American Council for Education, Science and Culture for their review. A copy of these reports must be sent to the Inter-American Human Rights Commission.

**Article 13 of the Protocol of San Salvador  
Right to Education**

1. Everyone has the right to education.
2. The States Parties to this Protocol agree that education should be directed towards the full development of the human personality and human dignity and should strengthen respect for human rights, ideological pluralism, fundamental freedoms, justice and peace. They further agree that education ought to enable everyone to participate effectively in a democratic and pluralistic society and achieve a decent existence and should foster understanding, tolerance and friendship among all nations and all racial, ethnic or religious groups and promote activities for the maintenance of peace.
3. The States Parties to this Protocol recognize that in order to achieve the full exercise of the right to education:
  - a. Primary education should be compulsory and accessible to all without cost;
  - b. Secondary education in its different forms, including technical and vocational secondary education, should be made generally available and accessible to all by every appropriate means, and in particular, by the progressive introduction of free education;
  - c. Higher education should be made equally accessible to all, on the basis of individual capacity, by every appropriate means, and in particular, by the progressive introduction of free education;
  - d. Basic education should be encouraged or intensified as far as possible for those persons who have not received or completed the whole cycle of primary instruction;
  - e. Programs of special education should be established for the handicapped, so as to provide special instruction and training to persons with physical disabilities or mental deficiencies.
4. In conformity with the domestic legislation of the States Parties, parents should have the right to select the type of education to be given to their children, provided that it conforms to the principles set forth above.
5. Nothing in this Protocol shall be interpreted as a restriction of the freedom of individuals and entities to establish and direct educational institutions in accordance with the domestic legislation of the States Parties

These obligations of the States are also complementary to other international instruments; among which are the following that also establish obligations in terms of human rights education: Convention Against Discrimination in Education; International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination; International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women; Inter-American Convention to Prevent and Punish Torture; Covenant 169 of the ILO on Indigenous and Tribal Peoples in Independent Countries; Convention on the Rights of the Child; Inter-American Convention on the Prevention, Punishment and Eradication of Violence against Women (Convention of Belem do Pará) and Inter-American Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Persons with Disabilities.

**Table 2: International instruments with HRE contents ratified as of 2003**

International Instruments	Argentina	Bolivia	Brazil	Chile	Colombia	Costa Rica	Dom Rep	Ecuador	El Salvador	Guatemala	Haiti	Mexico	Nicaragua	Panama	Paraguay	Peru	Suriname	Uruguay	Venezuela
1. Convention against Discrimination in Education	✓	-	✓	✓	-	✓	✓	✓	-	✓	-	-	✓	✓	-	✓	-	-	✓
2. International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
3. International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	-	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
4. International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
5. Inter-American Convention to Prevent and Punish Torture	✓	-	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	-	✓	-	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
6. Additional Protocol to the American Convention on Human Rights in the Area of Economic, Social and Cultural Rights–“Protocol of San Salvador”	✓	-	✓	-	✓	✓	-	✓	✓	✓	-	✓	-	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	-
7. Covenant No. 169 of the ILO concerning Indigenous and Tribal Peoples in Independent Countries	✓	✓	✓	-	✓	✓	-	✓	-	✓	-	✓	-	-	✓	✓	-	-	✓
8. Convention on the Rights of the Child	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
9. Inter-American Convention on the Prevention, Punishment and Eradication of Violence Against Women “Convention of Belem do Pará”	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
10. Inter-American Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Persons with Disabilities	✓	✓	✓	✓	-	✓	-	-	✓	✓	-	✓	-	✓	-	✓	-	✓	-
Compiled by IIHR																			

## Conceptual framework

Human rights education is understood, for the purposes of this Report, as a process of acquiring specific knowledge, skills and values in order to grasp, understand, assert and support one's own rights, grounded on norms set forth in different international instruments and in connection with domestic laws.<sup>7</sup> This means that all persons –independent of sex, national or ethnic origin and economic conditions- have the real possibility of receiving systematic, broad and good quality education that enables them to: understand their human rights and responsibilities; respect and protect the human rights of others; understand the relationship between human rights, the rule of law and democratic government; and exercise in their daily interaction values, attitudes and conduct that are appropriate to human rights and democratic principles. We understand this right to human rights education as part of the right to education and as a necessary condition for the effective exercise of all human rights.

It is common for human rights education to be circumscribed as “*training in human rights*,” which is merely one facet of it. The IIHR considers education in human rights instead as a cross-cutting element of the right to education, which should be present in the substantive and methodological aspects and in every possible form in formal and informal education. It should even be present in cultural processes and in the whole dynamic that influences the strengthening and reformulation of cultural patterns. In this manner, the right to human rights education, and the measurement of the degree of achievement of this right, is an issue linked to, but different from, the monitoring of the right to education and it is separate –as the flip side of the coin- from the assessment of the status of education in general, an issue for which there are already numerous and exhaustive exercises of observation and vigilance.

However, the right to receive an education in human rights, such as is defined in the Protocol of San Salvador and the other international instruments mentioned, is highly dependent on several factors, foremost among these are: (i) the international and national norms that establish this right and the corresponding obligation to adopt them, and public policies consistent with them be developed; (ii) the contents of human rights be integrated into the curriculum of the formal education system and in other informal education activities; (iii) said contents be part of the training of educators, judges, law enforcement personnel and other agents of the State; and, (iv) school textbooks need to reflect these contents and they should not contain references that are contrary to the fundamental values of gender equity or the acceptance and respect of ethnic diversity.

Special interest has been paid, in the preparation of this report, to three perspectives that express, the interests and the expectations of the social subjects particularly concerned with the theme of human rights, whose organizations and platforms of action have been taken into account at the time of designing the system: *gender equity; recognition of ethnic diversity; and interaction between the State and civil society*. The application of these perspectives as research and analytic tools contribute to establish to what degree the efforts of civil society, the State and the international community are responding to the aspirations of the people as conveyed by the civil society, movement in favor of human rights and democracy.

---

<sup>7</sup> This definition is adapted from the text “Circle of Rights. A tool for activism training in the defense of economic, social and cultural rights.” International Human Rights Internship Program/Forum-Asia 2000 p. 444.

## Methodological aspects

For the preparation of this series of reports, a system of indicators of progress (*measurable indices*) was used, allowing an evaluation, with a reasonable degree of objectivity, of the gaps between the real situation and the standards or desired goals. The indicator system was applied at two different time periods under equivalent conditions (1990 and 2000/03). The system also enables one to ascertain whether or not these gaps are being reduced and to obtain an indication of present trends.

The system was designed and tested in the area of human rights education and two other thematic fields (access to justice and political participation) in a pilot project carried out in six countries (Guatemala, Mexico, Nicaragua, Paraguay, Peru and Venezuela) between 2000 and 2001<sup>8</sup>.

With respect to HRE, a relatively simple system was used with two domains, six variables and 17 indicators. The results provided important indices regarding the more general trends concerning the modification of norms, curricula and texts, as well as the growing importance of formal education, in the face of a long and fruitful tradition developed by civil society organizations.

This first experience showed the viability of extending the exercise to the whole region, the need to develop a more detailed system of indicators and the suitability of expanding on the investigation from the cross-cutting perspectives. Furthermore, the exercise confirmed that changes in human rights education take place at a relatively slow rate and that, therefore, variations over short periods of time might be insignificant.

Applying the lessons learned in developing the system for a regional report, the domains used for the initial matrix were expanded in order to reflect in greater detail the compliance with the medium-term (adopting legislation and establishing public policies) and short-term (curriculum, course program and textbook modifications) obligations of the States in relation to the Protocol of San Salvador and other international instruments that set forth, directly or indirectly, standards on human rights education. Specific variables and indicators were prepared from the cross-cutting perspectives, which would bring about a reframing of the educational materials along these themes. A progressive work plan was adopted in order to take into account, each successive year, the four sets of variables relating to a specific field.

The structure defined for the series of four reports is the following:

**Year 2002:** Variations in the legal framework –international and national in the adoption of public policies and educational reform, relative to the establishment of education in human rights.

**Year 2003:** Variations in the design and content of the official curriculum that express the new judicial and political conditions; modifications in the plans and programs for the educational levels in which HRE is established as compulsory; and modifications in the content and forms of textbooks at selected levels.

**Year 2004:** Variations in the development of principles, contents and pedagogical guidance in human rights in the formation and training of teachers who are in charge of students between the ages of 10 and 16.

---

<sup>8</sup> The results are available at the IIHR Web site: ([www.iidh.ed.cr](http://www.iidh.ed.cr)) under: Special Sections/Human Rights Maps. The methodology for the design and application of the system is explained in greater detail therein.

**Year 2005:** Variations in educational activities, training and promotion in human rights, offered by nongovernmental institutions and organizations and other human rights educational service providers.

### The First Report (2002)

The matrix used in the First Report of the series (2002) for gathering information on the variations of the legal and regulatory framework regarding human rights education was the following:

<b>Table 3: Matrix used in the preparation of the First Report</b>	
<b>Variable</b>	<b>Means of verification</b>
1. Adoption of norms on HRE	Indicator 1: International Instruments
	Indicator 2: National Laws
2. Adoption of Public Policies	Indicator 1: Decrees, Rulings
	Indicator 2: Educational Course Plans and Documents
3. Institutional Development	Indicator 1: Government Departments specialized in HRE
	Indicator 2: Government Programs specialized in HRE
4. Right to Education	Indicator 1: Constitutional Norms
	Indicator 2: Percent of the National Budget Allocated in the Constitution to Education
	Indicator 3: Compulsory Nature of Education
	Indicator 4: Educational Enrollment

An important part of the information included in this First Report was contributed by participants in the XX Interdisciplinary Course on Human Rights, convened by the IIHR in July 2002. They prepared a brief report prior to attending the event, according to their experience and institutional setting. During the two-week course, the reports were shared, compared and systematized, including a discussion on the quality and suitability of the information, and highlighting any missing or inaccurate aspects.

Over the following months an IIHR team completed the information, in some cases through inquiries to institutions in each country, or to participants from previous courses. The conclusions of the First Report, which lay the groundwork for the development and understanding of this Second Report, are included in this section.<sup>9</sup>

### *Adoption of international norms*

By ratifying the international instruments that progressively configure – over a period of forty years – the right of all persons and the obligation of the State in favor of the establishment of human rights education, the 19 States being studied, have taken on the commitment of directing their education policies towards strengthening human rights and fundamental freedoms, as well as

<sup>9</sup> The First HRE Report is available in the annex to this report (CD-Rom) and in the IIHR Web site [www.iidh.ed.cr](http://www.iidh.ed.cr)

combating racial discrimination and discrimination against women. Each has ratified the Convention on the Rights of the Child. More than half have ratified conventions that –as in the case of the Protocol of San Salvador– significantly broaden the definition of education for democracy and peace, and require the setting in motion of specific actions and measures. At least five countries that have indigenous peoples living in their territory have still not ratified Covenant N° 169 of the ILO. The ratification of all of these treaties is important, but the delay in ratifying the Protocol of San Salvador is particularly a cause for concern.

### ***HRE in Constitutions***

Over the decades covered by this study, the incorporation of principles and/or content of HRE into national constitutions increased considerably, whether explicitly or implicitly. This trend appears to further the momentum initiated in the previous decade —that of the 1980s– since several countries that already had in 1990 a fairly broad characterization of education have enhanced it through recent constitutional reforms. Also, a macro-trend towards enriching the characterization of education is noticeable. This can be interpreted as progress in terms of education, which is associated with normative progress for HRE in the region.

### ***HRE in education laws***

There has been an increase in the incorporation of HRE principles and/or content in the domestic laws that regulate education in these 19 countries. The educational reform of the last two decades of the 20<sup>th</sup> Century have permeated gradually but consistently the general education laws with many principles and content of HRE. It is interesting to observe that some of the most extensive reform processes (those that in a single stroke modify a wide range of aspects of the education field) and that emphasize HRE principles, knowledge, values and attitudes took place after the countries made the transition from dictatorial to democratic regimes, or after the signing of peace agreements that ended internal armed conflicts.

### ***HRE in other legislation***

Shortly before the start of the decade being studied, there was a proliferation of special laws leading to strengthening the reestablishment of democracy and its institutions, human rights and the rule of law. During the period analyzed, these laws and institutions were reformed. The study confirmed that this legislation includes references to and objectives of HRE and other associated themes, such as education for democracy, civic education, education in values, etc. The inclusion of HRE in the internal norms of the countries under consideration coincides with several characteristic phenomena of the period studied, such as the restoration of democracy in several of the countries, the consolidation of democratic institutions, the adoption of constitutional, legal and administrative reforms, and the mobilization of civil society in favor of the full efficacy of human rights and the rule of law.

### ***Public policies and the institutional development of HRE***

The passing of constitutional reforms, education laws and other related components of HRE have set in motion numerous programs that develop its principles and content and the establishment of commissions, committees and other channels for promoting it. However, not all of these initiatives set a clear mandate or explicit references for the establishment of public State policies in favor of HRE. In part, this situation is related to –and in a sense is derived from– the relative

weakness of human rights policies in general, although the creation of entities such as Ombudsman offices have consolidated over the past years, in both the legal and institutional spheres.

In some countries there are reports of efforts to establish the institutional means, with the participation of the civil society, for preparing and furthering national human rights plans. Certainly, these efforts are explicitly involved in matters concerning education. However, these are still proposals under development that, even if they respond to the recommendations of different international meetings, such as the Vienna, Beijing and Durban Conferences, are highly dependent on the influx of initiative and resources from the international cooperation and have still not achieved the force that would come from an integral legal framework for strengthening human rights education as a permanent State policy, duly financed and institutionalized, such as has been demanded for several years by non-governmental organizations and social movements.

### **The Second Report (2003)**

This Second Report compares the situations prevailing in the year 1990 to those in the 2002/2003 school-year with regard to three domains: the set of norms, official documents and other administrative instruments that direct the official curriculum, as the expression of the political will of implanting into education specific objectives and directions; the documents that develop the programs and course plans of the academic subjects; and the explicit content and manner of presentation in school texts.

In each of these domains, attention is paid specifically to the inclusion of contents referring explicitly to human rights and constitutional guarantees; to justice, State institutions and the rule of law; to democracy, voting rights, elections, political and ideological pluralism; and to education in values (solidarity, human dignity, peace, tolerance and understanding between nations.)

Furthermore, aspects regarding the treatment of gender issues, the recognition of ethnic and cultural diversity and the relationship between the State and civil society are analyzed. This analysis involves both the inclusion of explicit content and the use of language, the handling of images in school textbooks and the representation of roles assigned to different characters in examples and illustrations.

The design of a system of domains, variables and indicators for this investigation brings together the elements that make up the definition of HRE, as adopted by the IIHR for its work. Also, it reflects the qualities that human rights education should have in accordance with Article 13 of the Protocol of San Salvador. Finally, it is the result of a series of consultations and pilot projects carried out in 2000 and 2001 with working groups and specialists in the field, who contributed to the determination of the aspects that, according to their experience, would best reflect the aspirations of the people and indicate the relevant progress in incorporating the themes of human rights education into educational instruments.

The information for each country was compiled by local consultants, selected for the most part from among participants of the XX and XXI Interdisciplinary Courses or other IIHR courses. IIHR staff coordinated the research and promoted an electronic discussion group among the consultants, in order to ensure the similarity and consistency in the results.



The matrix used for the preparation of this Report was the following:

<b>Table 4: Matrix used to prepare this Second Report</b>	
<b>Domain 1: Curricular regime in 1990 and 2003</b>	
<b>Variable 1:</b> Incorporation into the official document that directs the objectives and content of the curriculum	Indicator 1: Contents refer explicitly to human rights and constitutional guarantees
	Indicator 2: Contents refer explicitly to justice, State institutions and the rule of law
	Indicator 3: Contents refer explicitly to democracy, voting rights, elections, political and ideological pluralism
	Indicator 4: Contents refer explicitly to education in values (solidarity, human dignity, peace, tolerance and understanding among nations)
<b>Variable 2:</b> Incorporation of the contents into the official course programs for 5 <sup>th</sup> , 8 <sup>th</sup> and 11 <sup>th</sup> grades	Indicator 1: Contents refer explicitly to human rights and constitutional guarantees
	Indicator 2: Contents refer explicitly to justice, State institutions, and the rule of law
	Indicator 3: Contents refer explicitly to democracy, voting rights, elections, political and ideological pluralism
	Indicator 4: Contents refer explicitly to education in values (solidarity, human dignity, peace, tolerance and understanding among nations)

<b>Domain 2: School textbooks in 1990 and 2003</b>	
<b>Variable 1:</b> Incorporation of the contents into educational textbooks for 5 <sup>th</sup> , 8 <sup>th</sup> and 11 <sup>th</sup> grades	Indicator 1: Contents refer explicitly to human rights and constitutional guarantees
	Indicator 2: Contents refer explicitly to justice, State institutions and the rule of law
	Indicator 3: Contents refer explicitly to democracy, voting rights, elections, political and ideological pluralism
	Indicator 4: Contents refer explicitly to education in values (solidarity, human dignity, peace, tolerance and understanding among nations)

<b>Domain 3: Handling of cross-cutting perspectives in 1990 and 2003</b>	
<b>Variable 1:</b> Gender Equity	Indicator 1: Contents addressing gender equity in: 1) Official document setting the objectives and contents of the curriculum 2) Course programs 3) Textbooks
	Indicator 2: Language used in textbooks
	Indicator 3: Roles in which women are depicted in textbook illustrations
	Indicator 4: Number of women in relation to men in textbook illustrations
<b>Variable 2:</b> Ethnic Diversity	Indicator 1: Contents addressing ethnic diversity in: 1) Official document setting the objectives and contents of the curriculum 2) Course programs 3) Textbooks
	Indicator 2: Roles in which indigenous peoples are depicted in textbooks illustrations.
	Indicator 3: Number of indigenous peoples in textbook illustrations
	Indicator 4: Existence of auxiliary or complementary bibliography on intercultural issues and bilingualism
<b>Variable 3:</b> Interaction between civil society and the State	Indicator 1: The role of civil society in the process of preparing the curriculum
	Indicator 2: Contents that address the knowledge and/or participation of civil society in different governmental and non-governmental organizations in course programs and textbooks

## Sources of information consulted

### *Official documents that direct the curriculum*

It was a rather difficult task to identify the official document, other than the General Education Law and the course plans or programs for the different subjects, which establishes in a compulsory manner the organization and the key directions or guidelines for the school curriculum. The investigation was interested in finding a “bridge” between the statement of norms, public policies and the instruments used in the classroom with the purpose of underlining the range of the thematic content regarding human rights, democracy and values that was sought to be reinforced through education.

In many of the countries – and particularly in the framework of the educational reforms underway – technical documents were found, many of them prepared by councils, committees, or groups of consultants, which do not necessarily have administrative approval but that apparently guide the preparation of programs and textbooks. As can be seen in the following chart, these general principles are developed unevenly in education laws, guidelines and instructions issued by decree or Ministerial accord, and in the very course plans for the subjects. In general, these types of

documents establish in a combined way the objectives, content, didactic orientations, and evaluation mechanisms at each educational level, without expounding on the type and scope of the values that are sought to convey, nor on the placement of specific topics within the curriculum.

Table 5: Documents used to identify the curriculum guidelines		
Country	1990	2003
Argentina	Lineamientos Curriculares, Educación Básica, Provincia de Buenos Aires, 1986 ( <i>Curriculum Guidelines for Basic Education</i> )	Diseños Curriculares, Educación Básica y Polimodal, Provincia de Buenos Aires, 2001. ( <i>Curriculum Design, Basic and Polimodal Education</i> ) Contenidos Básicos Comunes para la EGB 1995. ( <i>Common Contents for Basic Education</i> )
Bolivia	Cuerpo de objetivos de la Educación Boliviana. Decreto Supremo N° 11498, de 1973 ( <i>Objectives of Bolivian Education</i> )	Reglamento de organización curricular. Decreto Supremo N° 23950, de 1995 ( <i>Regulation on curricular organization</i> )
Brazil	Parecer 853/71 do Conselho Federal de Educação, Câmara de Ensino de 1° e 2° Graus; fixa o núcleo comum para os currículos do ensino do 1° e 2° graus, e a doutrina do currículo na Lei 5.692/71; Resolução do Conselho Federal de Educação: Resolução n.º 8, de 1 de dezembro de 1971, anexa ao parecer n.º 853/71 - fixa o núcleo comum para os currículos do ensino de 1° e 2° graus, definindo-lhes os objetivos e amplitudes ( <i>Federal Education Council resolutions establishing the common core studies for 1<sup>st</sup> and 2<sup>nd</sup> grade</i> ) Decreto-lei N° 869, de 1969, que dispone sobre a inclusão de Educação Moral e Cívica como disciplina obrigatória nas escolas de todos os níveis e modalidades dos sistemas de ensino no País. ( <i>Decree establishing the compulsory nature of moral and civic education for all levels of schooling</i> )	Lei de Diretrizes e Bases da Educação; Lei N° 9.394, de 20 de dezembro de 1996; ( <i>Educational Foundations and Directives Law</i> ) Parecer da Câmara de Educação Básica do Conselho Nacional de Educação; Parecer CEB N°15/98, aprovado em 01/06/1998 - Sobre as Diretrizes Curriculares Nacionais para o Ensino Médio; Resolução CNE /CEB N°3, de 26 de junho de 1998: Institui as Diretrizes Curriculares Nacionais para o Ensino Médio (DCNEM); Parecer da Câmara de Educação Básica do Conselho Nacional de Educação: Parecer CEB/CNE N° 04/1998 - Sobre as Diretrizes Curriculares Nacionais para o Ensino Fundamental; Resolução CNE/CEB N° 02/1998: Institui as Diretrizes Curriculares Nacionais para o Ensino Fundamental. ( <i>Resolution of the National Education Council on Curriculum Directives for Basic and Middle Education</i> )
Chile	Decreto N° 4002 de 1980 que fija objetivos, planes y programas de la Educación General Básica. Decreto Exento N° 300 de 1981 que fija planes y programas para la educación media humanística científica. ( <i>Decrees establishing the objectives for basic and middle humanistic/scientific education</i> )	Decreto Supremo de Educación N° 240 de 1999 que establece objetivos fundamentales y contenidos mínimos obligatorios para la enseñanza básica. Decreto Supremo de Educación N° 220 de 1998 que establece objetivos fundamentales y contenidos mínimos obligatorios para la enseñanza media. ( <i>Decrees establishing the objectives for basic and middle education</i> )

Country	1990	2003
Colombia	Resolución Número 17487 del 7 de noviembre de 1984, por la cual se reglamenta el Decreto 1002 del 24 de abril de 1984 en cuanto a la adopción de Programas Curriculares para la Educación Básica Primaria. ( <i>Regulations of the Basic Education Curriculum Programs</i> ) Propuesta del Programa Curricular para Ciencias Sociales ( <i>Proposed social sciences curriculum</i> )	Serie Lineamientos Curriculares, Documento 1, Ministerio de Educación Nacional, 1998; ( <i>Curriculum Guidelines</i> ) Resolución No. 2343 de junio 5 de 1996. Santa Fe de Bogotá: Serie documentos especiales, 1996. ( <i>Special Resolution</i> )
Costa Rica	Política curricular 1990-1994. Acuerdo del Consejo Superior de Educación N° 77/90 ( <i>Curriculum Policy Agreement of the Superior Council for Education</i> )	Política educativa "Hacia el siglo XXI". Acuerdo del Consejo Superior de Educación N° 82/94 ( <i>Education policy towards the 21<sup>st</sup> Century Agreement of the Superior Council for Education</i> )
Dominican Republic	The official document directing the curriculum was not identified.	Plan Decenal de Educación, Sección Fundamentos del Currículo. ( <i>Ten-Year Education Plan, Curriculum Foundations Section</i> )
Ecuador	Other sections of the course programs were analyzed. Resoluciones Ministeriales N° 244 de octubre de 1976 y N° 245 de octubre de 1978. ( <i>Ministry Resolutions</i> )	Reforma Curricular para la educación Básica de 1996. Reforma Curricular del Bachillerato de 2001. ( <i>Curriculum Reform for Elementary and High School</i> )
El Salvador	Sistema curricular de El Salvador 1983. El sistema educativo, fundamentos doctrinarios, estructura, planes y programas. Número 3, Documentos de la Reforma Educativa de 1970. ( <i>Curricular System. Foundational doctrine, structure, plans and programs of Educational System. Education Reform documents</i> )	Fundamentos curriculares de la educación nacional, 1994-1999. Desafíos de la educación en el nuevo milenio, Reforma Educativa en Marcha, 2000-2005. Reforma Educativa en Marcha Documento III. Lineamientos del Plan Decenal (1995-2005). ( <i>Curriculum foundations. Educational reform and challenges for the new millenium. 1995-2005 Ten-Year Plan Guidelines</i> )
Guatemala	The official document directing the curriculum was not identified.	Diseño de Reforma Educativa 2002. ( <i>Design of the Educational Reform</i> )
Haiti	The official document directing the curriculum was not identified.	Plan Nacional de la Educación y de Formación (PNEF) de 1998 ( <i>National Education and Training Plan</i> )
Mexico	Other sections of the course plans are analyzed. Programa para la modernización educativa (1989-1994). ( <i>Educational modernization program</i> )	Acuerdo Nacional para la modernización de la educación básica de 1992. ( <i>National Educational Modernization Agreement</i> ) Programa Nacional de Educación 2001-2006 y Programa de Educación en Derechos Humanos. ( <i>National Education Program and Human Rights Education Program</i> )

Country	1990	2003
Nicaragua	The official document directing the curriculum was not identified.	Plan Nacional de Educación 2001-2015. ( <i>National Education Plan</i> ) Estrategia Nacional de Educación de 1999. ( <i>National Education Strategy</i> )
Panama	Other sections of the course programs were analyzed	Ley de Educación N° 34 de 1995. ( <i>National Education Law</i> ) There is a section in this law referring to the curriculum.
Paraguay	Innovaciones Educativas (Resolución Ministerial 1973) ( <i>Educational Innovations. Ministry Resolution</i> )	Diseño Curricular Nacional. Proyecto Reforma Joven - 2002-2004. ( <i>National Curriculum Design</i> ) La Reforma Educativa en el Aula (Documento elaborado por el Departamento de Currículo del Ministerio de Educación y Culto 1995) ( <i>Educational Reform in the Classroom</i> )
Peru	Other sections of the course programs were analyzed	Estructura curricular básica de educación primaria de menores (Resolución Ministerial de 1999) Diseño curricular básico de educación secundaria de menores (Resolución Directorial de 2001) ( <i>Basic curriculum structure of primary and secondary education for minors</i> ) Una nueva secundaria: propuesta de diseño curricular básico de educación secundaria de menores (Resolución Ministerial de 2002) ( <i>A New Secondary School: Basic Curriculum Design Proposal</i> )
Uruguay	The official document directing the curriculum was not identified.	Acta Extraordinaria N° 21 sobre Educación en Valores. (Resolución de 2001) ( <i>Statement on Education in Values</i> )
Venezuela	Reglamento de la ley orgánica de Educación de 1986. ( <i>General Education Law</i> ) Resoluciones Ministeriales No 410 y 412 de 30/06/86. ( <i>Ministry resolutions</i> ) Establishes the subjects, hourly course load, and course plans and programs for each level.	Currículo Básico Nacional. Resolución No 148 de 1999 ( <i>Basic National Curriculum</i> ) Ratifies the compulsory nature of pre-military instruction established since 1982.

### Course plans and programs for each subject

Due to the breadth of this field and based on the pilot projects and the consultations carried out previously, the work was based on a sample of subjects and grades or levels within the educational system, in order to better apply the data-gathering matrix. It was decided – as a general rule – to study a sample of the subjects and education levels that involve students between 8 and 16 years of age: social studies and civic education courses and the 5<sup>th</sup>, 8<sup>th</sup> and 11<sup>th</sup> grades or levels. In any case, the consultants for each country were at liberty to modify this selection in those cases where

the correlation between subjects and grades varied, or where it was evident that the human rights content are found elsewhere.

The course programs are generally comprised of different sections: objectives, content, activities, evaluation strategies. This survey is based on the examination of the first two sections: objectives and content, although in some cases the information was complemented by studying other sections. The consultants used the information for the subjects and grades mentioned in the following charts:

Table 6: Subjects and grades analyzed for 1990																		
	Argentina	Bolivia	Brazil	Chile	Colombia	Costa Rica	Dom Rep.	Ecuador	El Salvador	Guatemala	Haiti	Mexico	Nicaragua	Panama	Paraguay	Peru	Uruguay	Venezuela
Social Studies	5 <sup>th</sup> 8 <sup>th</sup>	5 <sup>th</sup> 8 <sup>th</sup>				5 <sup>th</sup> 11 <sup>th</sup>	5 <sup>th</sup> 8 <sup>th</sup>		5 <sup>th</sup> 8 <sup>th</sup>			5 <sup>th</sup> 8 <sup>th</sup>		5 <sup>th</sup>	5 <sup>th</sup> 8 <sup>th</sup> 11 <sup>th</sup>		8 <sup>th</sup>	
Civic Education	11 <sup>th</sup>	11 <sup>th</sup>				8 <sup>th</sup> 11 <sup>th</sup>	12 <sup>th</sup>	5 <sup>th</sup> 8 <sup>th</sup>	5 <sup>th</sup> 8 <sup>th</sup>		3 <sup>th</sup> 6 <sup>th</sup> 9 <sup>th</sup>	8 <sup>th</sup>		2 <sup>nd</sup> m	8 <sup>th</sup> 11 <sup>th</sup>	5 <sup>th</sup> 8 <sup>th</sup> 11 <sup>th</sup>	5 <sup>th</sup> 9 <sup>th</sup>	5 <sup>th</sup> 7 <sup>th</sup>
Others	11 <sup>th</sup> 1		3 <sup>rd</sup> m <sup>2</sup>	8 <sup>th</sup> 3				11 <sup>th</sup> 4 <sup>4</sup>						2 <sup>nd</sup> m <sub>5</sub> 5 <sup>th</sup> m 6 <sup>th</sup> m <sup>6</sup>			11 <sup>th</sup> 7 <sup>7</sup>	11 <sup>th</sup> 8 <sup>8</sup>

1: History, 2: History and Philosophy, 3: History and Geography, 4: Sociology, 5: History, 6: Government, 7: Sociology, 8: Pre-military Instruction. It refers to Middle education.

Table 7: Subjects and grades analyzed for 2003																		
	Venezuela	Uruguay	Peru	Paraguay	Panama	Nicaragua	Mexico	Haiti	Guatemala	El Salvador	Ecuador	Dom Rep	Costa Rica	Colombia	Chile	Brazil	Bolivia	Argentina
	5 <sup>th</sup> 6 <sup>th</sup>	5 <sup>th</sup> 8 <sup>th</sup>	8 <sup>th</sup>	11 <sup>th</sup>	5 <sup>th</sup> 8 <sup>th</sup>					5 <sup>th</sup> 8 <sup>th</sup> 11 <sup>th</sup>	8 <sup>th</sup>	8 <sup>th</sup>	5 <sup>th</sup> 8 <sup>th</sup>		1 <sup>st</sup> m 3 <sup>rd</sup> m 4 <sup>th</sup> m		5 <sup>th</sup> 8 <sup>th</sup> 11 <sup>th</sup>	Social Studies
	7 <sup>th</sup>	5 <sup>th</sup> 9 <sup>th</sup>		8 <sup>th</sup>	11 <sup>th</sup>	5 <sup>th</sup> 8 <sup>th</sup>	5 <sup>th</sup> 8 <sup>th</sup> 11 <sup>th</sup>	3 <sup>rd</sup> 6 <sup>th</sup> 9 <sup>th</sup>	5 <sup>th</sup>	11 <sup>th</sup>		5 <sup>th</sup> 12 <sup>th</sup>	5 <sup>th</sup> 8 <sup>th</sup> 11 <sup>th</sup>					Civic Education
	11 <sup>th</sup> 12 <sup>th</sup>	11 <sup>th</sup> 11 <sup>th</sup>	5 <sup>th</sup> 10 11 <sup>th</sup>		11 <sup>th</sup> 9		11 <sup>th</sup> 8				11 <sup>th</sup> 7			5 <sup>th</sup> 8 <sup>th</sup> 11 <sup>th</sup> 5	6 <sup>th</sup> 6 8 <sup>th</sup> 3 <sup>rd</sup> m 4 <sup>th</sup> m	5 <sup>th</sup> 2 8 <sup>th</sup> 3 3 <sup>rd</sup> m4		Others

1: Contemporary Argentine History, Philosophy and Citizen and Ethical Training, Institutional Spaces, Environmental and Health Guidance, Social Communication Guidance; 2: Cross-cutting Themes, Geography; 3: Cross-cutting Themes, Geography, History; 4: History, Philosophy, Sociology; 5: Economics and Political Studies, Ethics and Religion, Philosophy and Social Studies; 6: Study and Understanding of Society, History and Science; 7: Sociology; 8: Social, Economic and Political Problems of Mexico, Introduction to Law, National History, Philosophy; 9: History; 10: Personal and Social Issues, Social Development Issues; 11: Sociology; 12: Pre-military Instruction. It refers to Middle Education.

### School Textbooks

The analysis of textbooks is what most nearly approaches the everyday reality of the classroom, except for direct observation and ethnographic research. This domain reflects more closely than any other what the students and educators do and discuss, because it is the basis for everyday discussion and assignments (what is studied, how it is studied, and how it is put into practice). Above all, it should be acknowledged that textbooks always consist of a varied array, a truly polychromatic spectrum. Unlike curricular sources, the textbooks used everyday in the classrooms have diverse origins: in some cases, they were produced by the national educational institutions, or under their supervision (official textbooks); in others, they are readily available in the marketplace, produced by local or foreign publishing houses (commercial textbooks). Between these two extremes, we find others that, although produced by commercial publishers, were later approved by educational authorities and therefore their use is recommended in educational institutions (commercial texts with official approval). Each country has its own rules in this regard, and these also change according to the levels or cycles of the school system. The emphasis of each textbook differs according to their author's personal outlook. Consequently, we find considerable internal variation within this domain.

In all of the countries surveyed, the textbooks varied over the past decade. In 1990, textbooks edited in the 1980's or even at the end of the 1970's were used, whereas in 2003, books from the late 1990's or even the 2000's are in use. Most textbooks are very recent editions, which are up to date and have a current outlook of the subjects. The fact that the school systems of the region use recent textbooks is very important for the progress of HRE, since the significant normative changes of the past decade (highlighted in the first part of this Report) and the conceptual progress on this matter and on its application to the national realities, are reaching the stakeholders of the educational process more expediently.

Table 8: Textbooks used for the preparation of this report		
Country	1990	2002
Argentina	<b>5th.</b> Ciencias Sociales ( <i>Social Sciences</i> ). Editorial Estrada, Buenos Aires, Argentina, 1989. <b>1st</b> Educación media: Educación Cívica ( <i>Civic Education</i> ). Editorial Stella, 2da. Edición, Buenos Aires, Argentina, 1987. <b>4th</b> Educación media: Instrucción Cívica ( <i>Civic Education</i> ). Editorial Estrada, Buenos Aires, 1988.	<b>5th</b> de la EGB Ciencias Sociales ( <i>Social Sciences</i> ). <b>8th</b> de la EGB Ciencias Sociales ( <i>Social Sciences</i> ). <b>2nd</b> polimodal filosofía y formación ética y ciudadana II ( <i>Multiple subjects Philosophy and Ethical Citizen Education</i> ).
Bolivia	<b>5th:</b> Texto Escolar Integrado ( <i>Integrated Textbook</i> ), Editorial Educacional, 1990. <b>8th:</b> Ciencias Sociales ( <i>Social Sciences</i> ), Editorial Lux, 1990. <b>11th:</b> Educación Cívica ( <i>Civic Education</i> ), Editorial Bruño, 1987.	<b>5th:</b> Estudios Sociales ( <i>Social Studies</i> ), Editorial Don Bosco 1997. <b>8th:</b> Estudios Sociales ( <i>Social Studies</i> ), Editorial Don Bosco 1997. <b>11th:</b> Educación Cívica Ética y Democracia, ( <i>Civic Education, Ethics and Democracy</i> ), Editorial Hoguera, 2001.

Country	1990	2002
Brazil	<p><b>5th:</b> Educação Moral e Cívica (<i>Moral and Civic Education</i>) – Primeiro Grau, volume 1. São Paulo:</p> <p><b>8th:</b> Introdução à Política Brasileira (<i>Introduction to Brazilian Politics</i>). São Paulo: Editora Ática, 1988, 8ª Edição. Organização Social e Política do Brasil – para uma Geração Consciente (<i>Social and Political Organization of Brazil</i>). São Paulo: Editora Saraiva, 1991, 13ª Edição.</p> <p><b>3rd grade of Middle Education:</b> Educação Moral e Cívica – para uma Geração Consciente – (<i>Moral and Civic Education</i>) 2º Grau. São Paulo: Saraiva, 1989, 10ª Edição. Organização Social y Política do Brasil – para uma Geração Consciente (<i>Social and Political Organization of Brazil</i>) – 2º Grau. São Paulo: Saraiva, 1993, 13ª Edição.</p>	<p><b>5th:</b> Geografia Crítica – O Espaço Natural e a ação humana (<i>Critical Geography</i>) – volume 1. São Paulo: Ática, 2002, 30ª Edição.</p> <p>Historia e vida integrada (<i>Integrated History and Life</i>) – 5ª Série. São Paulo: Ática, 2002, 1ª Edição.</p> <p><b>8th</b> Nova História Crítica (<i>New Critical History</i>) – 8ª Série. São Paulo: Nova Geração, 1999 (2001). Geografia – Homem &amp; Espaço (<i>Geography: Man and Space</i>) – 8ª Série. São Paulo: Saraiva, 2000 – 16ª Edição reformada e atualizada (2001).</p> <p><b>3rd grade of Middle Education:</b> introdução à ciência da sociedade (<i>Intruduction to Social Sciences</i>). São Paulo: Moderna, 1997, 2º Edição (2002). Filosofando: introdução à Filosofia (<i>Introduction to Philosophy</i>). São Paulo: Moderna, 1993, 2ª Edição (2002).</p>
Chile	<p><b>5th:</b> “Historia y Geografía” (<i>History and Geography</i>) Editorial Universitaria, Ministerio de Educación, 1983.</p> <p><b>8th:</b> “Historia y Geografía” (<i>History and Geography</i>) Ministerio de Educación, 1996.</p> <p><b>3rd of Middle Education:</b> “Historia y Geografía de Chile” (<i>History and Geography</i>) Editorial Universitaria, Ministerio de Educación, 1985</p>	<p><b>5th:</b> “Estudio y Comprensión de la Sociedad” (<i>Study and Understanding of Society</i>) Editorial Mare Nostrum, Ministerio de Educación, 2003.</p> <p><b>8th:</b> “Estudio y Comprensión de la Sociedad” (<i>Study and Understanding of Society</i>) Ministerio de Educación, 2003.</p>
Colombia	<p><b>5th:</b> Pobladores Sociales (<i>Social Inhabitants</i>) Editorial Voluntad S.A.. Bogotá 1989-91. Hábitat 5 Ciencias Sociales (<i>Social Sciences</i>), Editorial Voluntad S.S. Bogotá, 1987.</p> <p><b>9th:</b> Ciencias Sociales Integradas 9 (<i>Integrated Social Sciences</i>), Educación Básica Secundaria, Editorial Voluntad S.A.. Bogotá 1989-93</p>	<p><b>5th:</b> Milenio 5 Ciencias Sociales (<i>Social Sciences</i>), Grupo Editorial Norma, Bogotá, 2002.</p> <p><b>8th:</b> Ciencias Sociales 8 (<i>Social Sciences</i>), Santillana Siglo XXI Básica Secundaria, Bogotá, 1999. Economía y Política 2 (<i>Economy and Politics</i>), Grupo Editorial Norma, Bogotá D.C., 2003.</p> <p><b>11th:</b> Economía y Política 2 (<i>Economy and Politics</i>), Grupo Editorial Norma, Bogotá D.C., 2003.</p>
Costa Rica	<p>Colección Chester Zelaya (<i>Textbook Series</i>) para estudiantes de 3º ciclo y educación diversificada. Editorial UNED. 1989.</p> <p><b>11º</b> Libro de Educación Cívica. Santillana 1994</p>	<p><b>5th</b> Estudios Sociales (<i>Social Sciences</i>). Editorial Norma 1997. Estudios Sociales (<i>Social Studies</i>) Editorial Hacia el Siglo XXI</p> <p><b>8th.</b> Educación Cívica (<i>Civic Education</i>). Editorial Norma 1999.</p> <p><b>11th</b> Educación Cívica (<i>Civic Education</i>). Editorial Santillana 2001</p>



Country	1990	2002
Dominican Republic	<p><b>5th</b> Libro de Texto de Estudios Sociales (<i>Social Studies Textbook</i>) Autor: Rafael Antonio González. Cuarta Edición. 1983.</p> <p><b>8th</b> Libro de texto de Estudios Sociales (<i>Social Studies Textbook</i>), Autores: Lidia Joaquin y Eleanor Grimaldi Silié. Primera Edición. 1989.</p> <p><b>11th</b>. Libro de texto de Educación Moral y Cívica. (<i>Moral and Civic Education Textbook</i>) Autor: José Nicolás Almanzar. Novena Edición, 1988.</p>	<p><b>5th</b>. Libro de Texto Oficial de Ciencias Sociales (<i>Official Social Sciences Textbook</i>).</p> <p><b>8th</b>. Libro de Texto Oficial de Ciencias Sociales. (<i>Official Social Sciences Textbook</i>)</p> <p><b>11th</b>. Libro de Texto Oficial de Ciencias Sociales: Sociedad 3. (<i>Official Social Sciences Textbook</i>) Historia y Geografía de la República Dominicana. (<i>History and Geography of the Dominican Republic</i>).</p>
Ecuador	<p><b>5th</b>: El Libro del Escolar Ecuatoriano, (<i>Ecuadorian Student's Handbook</i>) Primera Edición: 1944, edición revisada: sin fecha.</p> <p><b>8th</b>: Historia Geografía y Cívica (<i>History, Geography and Civics</i>)</p>	<p><b>5th</b>: Santillana Integral 5 (<i>Integral Textbook</i>), Editorial Santillana, 2002</p> <p><b>8th</b>: Estudios Sociales 8 (<i>Social Studies</i>) , Editorial Santillana, 2002</p> <p><b>11th</b>: Formación Ciudadana: Deberes, derechos y valores (<i>Citizen Education: Duties, rights and values</i>), Editorial Santillana, 2002</p>
El Salvador	<p><b>5th</b>: Texto de 5º grado de educación básica, (<i>5<sup>th</sup> Grade Textbook</i>), Colección Tazumal. Texto de 5º grado de educación básica (<i>5<sup>th</sup> Grade Textbook</i>) Madre Guillermina.</p> <p><b>7th</b>: Texto de 7º grado de educación básica, (<i>7<sup>th</sup> Grade Textbook</i>) Libro de trabajo de Estudios Sociales (<i>Social Studies Workbook</i>) 1980, Ministerio de Educación, Dirección de Televisión Educativa, Novena edición.</p>	<p><b>5th</b>: Texto de 5º grado de educación básica, (<i>5<sup>th</sup> Grade Textbook</i>) Colección Cipotes.</p> <p><b>11th</b>: Estudios Sociales y Cívica (<i>Social Studies and Civics</i>), 11º grado educación media, Servicios Educativos, colegio externado de San José. Estudios Sociales y Cívica II (<i>Social Studies and Civics</i>), Eladio Zacarías Ortiz</p>
Guatemala	No available data for this domain.	<p><b>5th</b> Libro de Texto Camino a la Excelencia 5 grado Historia Sinóptica de Guatemala (<i>Guatemalan Historic Synopsis</i>)</p> <p>Manual de Educación Cívica y Valores (<i>Civic Education and Values Handbook</i>)</p> <p>Marco General de la Transformación Curricular (<i>General Framework for Curriculum Transformation</i>)</p>
Haiti	No available data for this domain.	No available data for this domain.

Country	1990	2002
Mexico	<p><b>5<sup>th</sup>:</b> Libro de Texto Gratuito de Ciencias Sociales, (<i>Free Social Sciences Textbook</i>) Secretaría de Educación Pública, México, 1973, XVII edición, fecha de impresión: Febrero de 1989.</p>	<p><b>5<sup>th</sup>:</b> Libro de Texto Gratuito de Ciencias Naturales (<i>Free Natural Sciences Textbook</i>), Secretaría de Educación Pública, 1998, III edición revisada, fecha de impresión: septiembre de 2001. Libro de Texto Gratuito de Español (<i>Free Spanish Textbook</i>), Secretaría de Educación Pública, México, 1998, fecha de impresión: septiembre de 2001.</p> <p><b>4<sup>th</sup>-5<sup>th</sup>-6<sup>th</sup>:</b> Material de trabajo escolar Conoce Nuestra Constitución (<i>Know our Constitution Workbook</i>), Secretaría de Educación Pública, México, 1997, V reimpresión: abril de 2002.</p> <p><b>2<sup>nd</sup> High School:</b> Formación Cívica y Ética 2 secundaria (<i>Ethical and Civic Education</i>), Editorial Nuevo México, 1999, tercera reimpresión: febrero de 2002. Ética, Pearsona Educación, México, 1998. Ética ciudadana: de lo individual a lo social. De lo social a lo global (<i>Citizen Ethics: from individual to social, from social to global</i>), Prentice Hall, México.</p>
Nicaragua	No available data for this domain	<p><b>5<sup>th</sup>:</b> Guía Didáctica sobre los Derechos Humanos de la Niñez y la Adolescencia (<i>Educational Guide on the Human Rights of Children and Adolescents</i>), 2002. Ministerio de Educación. Texto de Cívica, Moral, y Urbanidad. Aprendamos a Convivir (<i>Civics, Moral and Good Manners Textbook. Let's learn to get along</i>), 1992. Ministerio de Educación. Texto Cívica, Moral y Urbanidad de Quinto Grado (<i>Fifth Grade Textbook on Civics, Morality and Good Manners</i>), 1998. Ministerio de Educación</p> <p><b>8<sup>o</sup>:</b> Texto Formación Cívica y Social (<i>Civic and Social Education Textbook</i>), 1998. Ministerio de Educación</p> <p><b>11<sup>o</sup>:</b> Texto Formación Cívica y Social (<i>Civic and Social Education Textbook</i>), 1998. Ministerio de Educación.</p>

Country	1990	2002
Panama	<p><b>5th:</b> Estudios Sociales América, Panamá y Europa. (<i>Social Studies: America, Panama and Europe</i>). Editorial Escolar, 1985.</p> <p><b>8th</b> Democracia y Civismo (<i>Democracy and Civism</i>), Ediciones Manfer, 1984</p> <p><b>5° de la educación media</b> Historia de Panamá, Editorial Editextos Ltda., 3ª Edición, 1980.</p>	<p><b>5th:</b> Estudios Sociales 5 (<i>Social Studies</i>), Educación Básica General. Ministerio de Educación. República de Panamá, Panamá, 1999.</p> <p><b>8th</b> Aprendamos Cívica Panameña (<i>Let's learn Panamanian Civics</i>), Editorial Norma, Tercera Edición, 2001.</p> <p><b>5th of Middle Education:</b> Historia de Panamá, (<i>History of Panama</i>) Editorial Chong Ramos, Cuarta Edición Corregida y Mejorada, 1998.</p>
Paraguay	<p><b>5th:</b> Libro de Textos Estudios Sociales 5 (<i>Social Studies Textbook</i>), Departamento de Producción de Material Educativo del Ministerio de Educación y Culto, 1980.</p> <p><b>8th:</b> Libro de Texto Estudios Sociales 2 (<i>Social Studies Textbook</i>), Departamento de Currículo del Ministerio de Educación y Culto, 1989.</p> <p><b>4th High School</b> Educación Cívica (<i>Civic Education</i>)</p>	<p><b>5th:</b> Programa Mejoramiento de la Educación Primaria (<i>Primary School Improvement Program</i>), Ministerio de Educación y Cultura, 1997.</p> <p><b>8th:</b> Programa Mejoramiento de la Educación Secundaria (<i>Primary School Improvement Program</i>), Ministerio de Educación y Cultura, 2000</p>
Peru	<p><b>5th:</b> Educación Cívica “Descubrir”, Enciclopedia Escolar 5 (<i>Civic Education, “Discover” School Encyclopedia</i>), According to the Ministry of Education Curriculum Program, Editorial Navarrete S.A.</p> <p><b>8th:</b> “Educación Cívica 2” (<i>Civic Education</i>), Conforme al Programa Oficial Vigente, Editorial Escuela Nueva.</p> <p><b>11th:</b> “Educación Cívica 5” (<i>Civic Education</i>), Fausto Morillo Acuña. Para el Quinto Grado de Educación Secundaria. Cuarta Edición. According to the New Valid Official Curriculum. Editorial Escuela Nueva S.A. Lima. Perú</p>	<p><b>5th:</b> Personal Social “Escuela Nueva 5” (<i>New School – Social/Personal</i>), According to the Curriculum Program. Primera Edición, octubre 2000.</p> <p><b>8th:</b> Educación Cívica 2 (<i>Civic Education</i>), Séptima Edición, According to the Valid Official Program. Primera Edición. Editorial Escuela Nueva, Enero 2002. “Ciencias Sociales 2” (<i>Social Sciences</i>) , Asociación Editorial Bruño, 2002.</p> <p><b>11th:</b> “Educación Cívica 5” (<i>Civic Education</i>) , Primera Edición, According to the New Valid Official Curriculum, Editorial Escuela Nueva.</p>
Uruguay	<p><b>9th:</b> “Educación Social y Cívica” (E. Vescovi) (<i>Social and Civic Education</i>) Texto: “Educación Social y Cívica” (<i>Social and Civic Education</i>) (Landoni – González – Guisoli)</p>	<p><b>5th:</b> ”Texto Una América para descubrir” (<i>Textbook: An America to Discover</i>)</p> <p><b>8th:</b> Texto Comprendiendo América” (<i>Textbook Understanding America</i>)</p>
Venezuela	<p><b>7th:</b> “Educación Familiar y Ciudadana” (<i>Family and Citizen Education</i>) de Héctor Zamora. Editorial C0-B0.</p>	<p><b>5th:</b> Ciencias Sociales. (<i>Social Sciences</i>) Editorial Co-Bo y Ciencias Sociales Nuevo Milenio (<i>Social Sciences New Millenium</i>) de Editorial Santillana</p>



## **Section II**

### **Analysis of the Results of the Investigation**

#### **Inclusion of contents on human rights and constitutional guarantees**

A review of documents that orient the content of the school curriculum show from different aspects that in 1990, one-third of the 18 countries had not incorporated human rights and constitutional guarantees explicitly as a component of the teaching/learning process. Another third was contemplating in some way the study of individual rights and responsibilities in accordance with constitutional norms. And in four cases, explicit reference was made to human rights in general.

The expressions used in such documents, although not always explicit demonstrate a trend towards introducing the recognition of an individual's rights and the rights of others as the basis for social coexistence, and recommend instilling this relationship as an element of education and student behavior.

As of 1990, only in one country was the Universal Declaration mentioned as a reference that should inspire educational processes; in another country, the systematic teaching of human rights was established as a cross-cutting component of the curriculum; and in three countries reference is made to the system of guarantees, associated with justice.

In the documents in force in 2003, explicit references to the theme of human rights increase to two-thirds of the countries surveyed. In a majority of cases, in addition to knowledge of fundamental rights, their promotion and defense is encouraged. In some countries, this theme is established as a cross-cutting perspective of education –and of educational reform – and this includes the recognition of rights violations and information regarding the existence of international mechanisms for protection. The specific rights of children – as established in the Declaration and in the Convention – are especially mentioned in the documents that orient the curriculum in two countries.

There is also an increase, by 2003, in explicit and detailed references to constitutional guarantees and to some mechanisms for their protection such as habeas corpus and “amparo.” In all cases, a direct association is made between such guarantees and the primacy of democracy, on one hand, and the administration of justice, on the other.

In general, in the more recent expressions of the curriculum a clear association stands out between the teaching of human rights and training in ethical, civic and social values, the achievement of social equity, the fight against discrimination and the rule of law. Currently, these statements replace the notion of forging individual conduct with the idea of creating an awareness of the rights and obligations of citizens, including the respect of the rights of others and the awareness of the State as guarantor of this social relationship.

A recent document from Mexico (dated November 4, 2002) illustrates this evolution towards the full incorporation of HRE into education, as can be seen in the following excerpt:

*Agreement by which the Secretariat of Public Education (SEP) is instructed, within the framework of the functions set forth in the law and in accordance with the 2001-2006 National Education Program, to proceed to elaborate a Program for Education in Human Rights. Said program shall have as its objective: "I. To assert the general principles of education in this field, which consist of [...] e) Promoting knowledge of the instruments and mechanisms for the protection of human rights, and the ability to apply them at the local, national, regional and global levels; [...] II. To design sequentially, within the terms of the General Education Law, content for the promotion and defense of Human Rights, to be incorporated within the existing course plans and programs at all levels of education." For the elaboration of said Program, the Agreement points out that the SEP "[...] shall take into account the opinion of public institutions and non-governmental organizations, as well as those of individuals who have played an important role in the defense and promotion of Human Rights".*

An examination of course programs of a sample of subjects and grades for the 18 countries within the scope of this Report confirms a tendency to vary throughout the decade, as shown by the curriculum documents. It also shows that the amount and level of detail of the content in the programs is much greater than was implied in the general curriculum documents. Explicit contents on human rights were identified in school subjects for 1990, in half the countries. By 2003 this was the case for all of the countries.

In the course programs for subjects in 1990, most information pertains to general principles of human rights, their origin, evolution, characteristics and classification. The instrument more commonly taught is the Universal Declaration and, in some cases, its fundamental statements are linked to references on international bodies and instruments of protection. In two of the countries, the rights of children are mentioned as a subject of instruction.

Exercises to recognize fundamental rights in constitutional texts are also included and these rights are associated with life in democracy. For certain subjects taught in some countries, there is an area on recognizing human rights violations, their consequences on national life, and the penalties therefor.

In 2003, the most significant innovations are related to a massive and detailed incorporation of the study of the rights of children and youths and to familiarizing students with the Declaration of the Rights of the Child. Frequent references can also be found to the specific rights of women, the elderly and indigenous peoples. In three cases, the rights of workers are added to this subset of specific rights.

Interest continues for the general study of the principles, history and classification of human rights, but these are mentioned with a new emphasis, that of social, economic and cultural rights and, in some countries, environmental rights as well. This introduces the perspective of collective rights, in contrast to that of individual rights, which was dominant the previous decade.

A new area, which has recently expanded significantly, is the concept of the promotion and protection of human rights, including knowledge of the institutions and mechanisms for its defense – nationally and internationally – in the face of violations. This approach has begun to take the place of a descriptive study of international bodies, their structure and functions. With regard to this more proactive perspective, reflection on the most recurring violations and on their consequences for national life and democracy appears as an important learning resource, replacing to some extent the old emphasis on learning by rote the Universal Declaration. In one country,

the program proposes an exercise comparing human rights violations in Africa, Asia and Latin America. In a couple of subjects, the theme of citizen security, in the face of violence and human rights violations has been found. In one of the countries, the study of issues of international humanitarian law and the International Committee of the Red Cross is included.

Several programs retain the practice of associating internationally recognized human rights with a statement of fundamental guarantees from the Constitutions; the idea that the first level for the exercise of rights and duties is comprised of the family, the school and the community is introduced; and the domestic legal mechanisms for the defense of fundamental rights are presented. Occasionally a trend linking these themes to the interaction between civil society and the State can be seen.

Examples of human rights statements in course programs	
<p><b>1990</b></p> <p><i>Studies the first ten articles of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights.</i></p> <p><i>Applies norms and principles related to human rights in my family, school and community life.</i></p> <p><i>Analyzes the human rights protected in the Constitution; evaluates the practice of the human rights protected in the Constitution.</i></p>	<p><b>2002</b></p> <p><i>Denounces the violation of his rights and those of other people.</i></p> <p><i>Identifies everyday facts that promote or hinder the exercise of human rights.</i></p> <p><i>Analyzes the aggressions against human rights, proposes solutions or alternatives to such aggressions.</i></p>

The recognition of fundamental guarantees, in 1990 and 2003, is based on the knowledge of Constitutional norms. In half the countries, this is approached from the viewpoint of the rights and duties of the citizen, both in civic and public life, and in the personal sphere. In the other half, the guarantees that the Constitutions offer the citizens for the enjoyment of these rights are given greater emphasis. As in the treatment of human rights in general, the programs in force in 1990 give greater prominence to the study of guarantees related to civil and political rights as individual rights. By 2003, the collective rights that are subject to guarantee by the State are more broadly introduced, stressing the obligations of the State in terms of economic, social and cultural rights. Moreover, in some countries the idea of the specific rights of certain social sectors, like children, the elderly, and the disabled, are introduced. Also, the more recent programs strongly associate the system of guarantees with the exercise of democracy and the rule of law (due process).

In four countries, the study or knowledge of the Ombudsman as the institution responsible for the guardianship of human rights is included. The Constitutional Court is only found in the course program of one country, and there is only one country that addresses the issue of constitutional appeals.

Constitutional guarantees is one area in which the programs show few variations, which mostly deal with their broadening in accordance with new or amended Constitutions during the 1990s.

**Examples of objectives and content related to constitutional guarantees in the course programs**

*Become aware of the importance of our Constitution for the organization of the Nation.*

*Recognize the need to establish public powers and the exercise of the principle of authority in the democratic regime.*

*For the students to attain an understanding of the nature of democracy in terms of government systems and be able to distinguish them from undemocratic forms of government.*

*Identify the rights that the Constitution recognizes for every person: equality (before the law, before justice, before public officials), freedom (personal, of assembly, of association, of opinion, of conscience, of education, of property), inviolability (of the home, and of correspondence) and recognize the restrictions that they may be subject to in the event of an emergency.*

*Understand the importance of the exercise of rights and the fulfillment of obligations for the harmonious coexistence of a democratic society.*

*Ability to relate constitutional guarantees with their function in the democratic life of the citizen.*

*Recognize and accepts the rights of all human beings to life, to the respect of their physical and moral integrity, to carry out work adequate to his age and to have a nationality. Discovers that the rights of children are the responsibility of adults. Defend his/ her rights and respects the rights of others in the school, home and community.*

*Identify and comprehend the civil, political, economic and social rights contemplated in the Constitution, recognizing the importance of the construction of a participative democracy. Understand the importance of the participation of civil society in the protection and promotion of human rights and the construction of democratic institutions and values.*

In the textbooks for 1990, there is already information on fundamental rights and constitutional guarantees in at least two-thirds of the countries studied. Both concepts tend to be presented as being equivalent, since in general terms *rights* – always mentioned along with *duties* –are always listed and explained on the basis of the guarantees set out in the Constitution. They are often designated as “citizen rights and duties” or “constitutional rights and duties” (and in a couple of cases as “rights and duties of the individual/of man”). The expression “human rights” is not generally used in all the textbooks.

Several texts address the “rights and duties of children,” generally as a separate topic. The development of those rights is supported primarily on the text of the Constitutions, although about half the textbooks mention the Universal Declaration of Human Rights and a few mention the Declaration of the Rights of the Child (1959).

In 2003, all of the textbooks analyzed include content on human rights and constitutional guarantees. Without exception, they incorporate the concept of “human rights” and base this concept both on constitutional norms and on international instruments, among which the Universal Declaration continues to be the one most often cited, but never the only one mentioned.



Also, the rights of children have expanded markedly in both frequency and detail, especially in the lowest of the grades analyzed, the 5<sup>th</sup> grade of primary school. Its presentation is now based on the Convention on the Rights of the Child (1989) and generally stresses that the country is one of the signatories. Two changes in the language used in the textbooks are particularly noteworthy with regard to this matter. For one thing, the notion of “rights” is separated from “and duties” so commonly joined a decade ago, even in the very title of the subject, which brought with it the risk of reinforcing the erroneous concept that if people do not fulfill certain duties, then they do not have certain rights. On the other hand, inclusive language begins to be used when referring to “the rights of boys and girls”<sup>10</sup> instead of using the traditional “rights of the child / of children” (showing that there is greater care in treating in an equitable manner the question of gender, consistent with the remarkable progress in this area, as we have analyzed in a previous section of this Report). These changes are not merely of style; but rather demonstrate steady conceptual progress.

The contents of human rights in the textbooks for 2003 are much broader than a decade ago, in conjunction with a wider range in the scope of the course programs. But on several occasions, the textbooks go further than the programs, due to the emphasis of the authors. Among the themes that are better developed are, for example, the philosophical-ethical framework and historical background of human rights; respect for rights as the basis for democracy; analysis of economic, social and cultural rights, and other collective rights such as those affecting the environment and the consumer; legal instruments and national and international protection mechanisms; consequences of human rights violations; national and world movements and organizations in the defense of human rights; and the rights of specific populations (the most frequently addressed are children and youth, women and indigenous peoples and; to a lesser extent, other ethnically diverse populations such as people of African descent, and in at least one case the topic of migrant populations is dealt with in depth).

A frequent characteristic when addressing new themes is to study them from a current perspective, relating them to the everyday life of students and their community. The methodological resource used to make this connection consists of practical activities, that as a set are found to be more numerous, dynamic and participative than those in the 1990 textbooks. Whereas a decade ago reading and discussion activities were predominant, currently group and individual field research activities and projects are more common.

It is interesting that many textbooks deal extensively with massive human rights violations in history by analyzing recent cases, for example, genocide and forced disappearances, in the world and in the very countries where they occurred. In the face of these circumstances, human rights are presented as guarantees against the arbitrary and authoritative exercise of force. Therefore knowledge about them – and that of the legal instruments and NGOs that defend them is emphasized with the explicit purpose of preventing future violations. Such an updated, critical and deliberately awareness-building perspective was little less than taboo for textbooks in the past.

In addition to the progress described above, references to human rights and constitutional guarantees tend to appear in 2003 in more grades from the sample surveyed and, in several cases,

---

<sup>10</sup> Translators’s Note. The Spanish words *niño* (child, boy) and *niños* (children, boys), though traditionally used also for the generic form, refer specifically to the male gender. Since there isn’t a specific gender-neutral word for child or children in Spanish, the wording *niños y niñas* (boys and girls) has come to be preferred in order to reflect gender equity when describing the rights of children, and the instruments that protect these rights.

in more than one subject in these grades. At least two-thirds of the countries use textbooks for 5<sup>th</sup>, 8<sup>th</sup> and 11<sup>th</sup> grades that address the subject in one way or another, regardless of whether it appears or not in the course plan for that grade.

### **Inclusion of content on justice, State institutions and the rule of law**

The documents that regulate the curriculum state as a goal the transmittal to students of information on the structure and organization of the State and of the rule of law as a means of coexistence. Among the documents consulted for the year 1990, this statement was explicit in one-third of the 18 countries and in two-thirds of them in 2003. As will be seen, this goal has been accomplished, for all of the countries, in the course programs of Civics, Social Studies and the like.

In the two years analyzed, there is a description of the structure and functions of the State, with an emphasis on the constitutional basis of this structure and the existence of the three branches of government: legislative, executive and judicial. In 1990, only three countries deal with the issue of justice and one of them that of equity. In general, the documents that contain some mention to these themes present the idea of political stability as resting on compliance with the legal order.

The documents for 2003 are more explicit. They tackle themes of justice as a mechanism for protecting rights and of the pursuit of the general welfare and social equity as attributes that should guide the administration of public institutions. There are also references to the independence and balance between the different branches of government as a fundamental characteristic of the State. In some countries, institutions of control and electoral bodies are explicitly mentioned, and in four countries the Ombudsman or its equivalent is discussed.

In four countries, the concept of the rule of law is explicitly used and in all of them a direct association is made between democracy and the prevalence of legality. The development of these themes, related to the structure of the State, legality and justice, are also presented as means for promoting values such as national identity and patriotism.

The treatment of these themes in the course programs of the subjects analyzed, both for 1990 and for 2003, is extensive. There is content relating to the definition of the concept of State, its constituent elements and characteristics, including comparisons with different types of State structures and forms of government. A considerable part of the subject of Civics, or its equivalent, is dedicated to the study of the main public institutions and the role of government officials in relation to the structure of the State, the satisfaction of the citizens and the promotion of development. In general terms, the objectives of the programs seek to create positive attitudes towards public institutions and to promote a model of a united, democratic and republican State, with a clear division of powers and a suitable hierarchical structuring of its political elements. Also, different forms of government are studied and compared, with a clear choice in favor of those systems based on the direct election of the authorities, a presidential form of government and the relative autonomy of more local governments (states, provinces and municipalities). Instrumental objectives are also pursued, in terms of promoting the development by the students so as to improve their use of the services of the State.

In several countries, specific units are dedicated to information on the political and administrative distribution, with special attention to municipal government and organization, which in several cases introduces the issue of citizen participation in the administration of matter of public interest.

The more recent programs pay greater attention to the study of the agencies of political-administrative control, the idea of public responsibility for social equity, and the notion of decentralization.

Examples of the objectives and content on State institutions in the course programs	
<p><b>Objectives</b></p> <p><i>To analyze the structure of the State, its functions and importance for the consolidation of democracy</i></p> <p><i>To know and comprehend the origin of the Constitution and the functions of the local, departmental, regional and national institutions and authorities</i></p> <p><i>To analyze the objectives of the State, explain its organization and the functions of its branches</i></p> <p><i>To analyze in a critical manner the organization, structure, functions and relations of the State</i></p> <p><i>To distinguish between the more well-known forms of government that currently exist in order to present arguments for and against these regimes.</i></p> <p><i>To identify the characteristics that distinguish the current systems of government in order to appreciate the positive aspects of the democratic system and to commit to the functioning of said system</i></p>	<p><b>Content</b></p> <p><i>The branches of government, organization and functions of the Executive, Legislative and Judicial Branches</i></p> <p><i>The forms of government. Characteristics.</i></p> <p><i>Elements of the State.</i></p> <p><i>Sovereignty.</i></p> <p><i>Municipal Regime.</i></p> <p><i>Characteristics and services provided by the State.</i></p> <p><i>The Constitution as fundamental law of the State; structure and functions of the State; political, economic and ideological functions.</i></p> <p><i>Characterization of the Nation-State in its ethnic, regional and religious differences and its vocation for unity.</i></p> <p><i>Principles, concepts and values of the democratic State, political organization, values for compromise, convergent work, peaceful resolution of conflicts.</i></p>

Although in the curriculum the matter of justice is emphasized as a fundamental value of the rule of law, in the programs there is a lack of explicit content clearly related to preparing the students to understand the practical function of the administration of justice or the recognition of problems related to access to justice and, in general, the functioning of judicial bodies. No explicit references have been found with regard to the problem of corruption and means to combat it nor about the accountability of authorities, although some of the programs do include, among the constitutional guarantees, that of requesting and obtaining information from public authorities.

The school textbooks examined, both for 1990 and 2003, very closely follow the course programs in effect at the time. Their development of content on justice, State institutions and the rule of law offers a similar view to the one described for the course programs.

Considering the textbooks as a whole, no manifest and uniform trends of variation can be observed. The changes that are reported in 2003 in some countries are related to the depth of the

approach to some themes, but they do not always shift in the same direction: sometimes there is greater depth than in 1990; other times there is less; at times it decreases for one grade and increases for another. The constant trend is that all the textbooks feature an analysis of the democratic State, its powers and the institutions, within the constitutional framework. The new components in 2003 correspond to recently created institutions, such as the Ombudsman or its equivalent, the Constitutional Courts and in very few cases, the Offices for Women.

The content referring to justice in the school textbooks tends to focus on the Judicial Branch. Mainly its attributes and structure (basically Courts of First Instance, Courts of Appeals and Supreme Courts) are analyzed. In general, the Judicial Branch is explained in less detail than the Executive and Legislative.

In several textbooks, especially for 2003, justice also appears as an ethic and social value, on a par with equality and equity. (This perspective is analyzed in a later section, when the topic of education in values is addressed). However, the textbooks reviewed leave the impression that very little or no connection is established between the perspective of values and the institutional perspective of justice. As an exception to this, a couple of textbooks mention the current phenomena of the crisis in the legitimacy of institutions (difference between legality and legitimacy), impunity and corruption as threats to the rule of law.

As another noteworthy exception, a few of the textbooks for 2003 have exercises that fill gaps in the course programs. For example, although explicit content on access to justice was not found in the programs, one textbook for 11<sup>th</sup> grade was particularly rich in content on the rule of law, and that proposes, as practical activities, the preparation of a “habeas corpus” request and investigating when and in which cases it applies, and the carrying out of an assignment on a news story involving collective rights, constitutional rights, and the role of the Ombudsman.

### **Inclusion of content on democracy, the right to vote, elections and political and ideological pluralism**

The documents that regulate the curriculum, both for 1990 and for 2003, contain numerous references to democracy under different forms. Democracy is portrayed as a theoretical underpinning of education, which emanates from the democratic character of the State and which is an inspiration for the organization of learning and of the educational services themselves. Democracy is also presented as a goal of education, both in the broader sense of generating, asserting and strengthening the democratic values of society, and in the strictly pedagogic sense of educating citizens for democratic life and the exercise of their inherent rights. From another perspective, in the documents of some countries education is presented as a condition that allows, or contributes to, the strengthening of democratic practices and values of society, and the training of students to promote and defend democracy and to be able to know and demand their own political rights.

Democracy is proposed also as a characteristic of educational processes and of the school. Several documents insist on the need for living and practicing democratic values in the classroom, in relations between teachers and students, in interactions within the school and between the school and the family and community. School governments –and other forms of participation in all the types of student associations- are proposed as a democratic activity and a pedagogic strategy. With the exception of this last content (school government) there were no other explicit references to voting and elections found in the curriculum.

Explicit mentions of ideological, political and religious pluralism as a characteristic of education, or as a content of it, are very few: they were only found for 2003 and in four of the 18 countries.

Between 1990 and 2003 there were some differences worth pointing out. Explicit references to democracy were found in the curricula of nine of the countries for 1990 and of 17 for 2003. The most recent instances show greater levels of segregation of the themes that in 1990 appeared only as simple statements, referring mainly to an abstract value or a characteristic form of government. The more current expressions present democracy as a political-juridical system, as a lifestyle and a culture, which is constructed on the groundwork of citizen participation and is an attribute of modernity. Terms like tolerance, consensus, compromise and governance appear associated with democracy in the documents. In three countries, the democratic quality of education is explicitly associated with the recognition of ethnic diversity.

The treatment of these themes in the subject course programs, on the other hand, is abundant and detailed. For 1990, programs were identified in twelve countries that include objectives that associate democracy, political rights and the practice of voting; most of these objectives are shown in content related to the significance and importance of the vote, knowledge of electoral systems and institutions and the political party regime. Some programs include the holding of elections, assemblies and other democratic activities for the establishment of different types of student committees. Three refer explicitly to respect for political, ideological and religious pluralism. For 2003, these contents have been developed in the programs of all countries. In most cases, much greater detail appears, especially in those countries where educational reform has advanced over the past decade.

The increase in the amount and type of content on democracy, suffrage and pluralism is accompanied by an important variation in the pedagogic perspective on these matters. At first glance, a shift is observed from education centered on descriptive knowledge of norms and institutions towards the introduction of concepts such as representation, legitimacy and participation. Other issues introduced as a result of this shift include the compulsory nature of the vote, absentee voting, different political party systems, and the role of civil society in the construction of democracy, among others.

**Examples of objectives and contents as stated in  
the course programs for 1990 and reiterated in the course programs for 2003**

***Concept, origin and historical evolution of democracy.*** To explain the concept, origin, historical evolution of democracy and its influence in citizen life.

***School government.*** To relate the school government with the democratic process of the country.

***Democratic and authoritarian governments.*** To distinguish between the characteristics of democratic systems of government and totalitarian ones.

***The mass media in a democratic society.*** The Electoral Branch and the power of the press. The role of democratic regimes. Importance.

***The vote, characteristics.*** To act with full awareness of his/her actions in civic life and to actively participate in the exercise of suffrage.

***Electoral Tribunals and Bodies:*** To value the importance of the Supreme Electoral Tribunal as an institution that has contributed to the perfecting of national democracy.

***Political parties:*** Political systems and regime. Political parties. The party in power.

In some countries this theme –besides being a part of Civics or its equivalent- is also addressed in relation to national history. In these cases, the emphasis is on democratic crises and recovery, peace and social coexistence, and criticism of the experience under totalitarian governments. In other cases, these issues are dealt with in a complementary manner in subjects related to the study of national reality and its problems, in which cases democracy and its practices are linked with human development and the resolution of conflicts.

While most programs refer to the political party system as an element that contributes to democracy, only in one country was a segment of the program dedicated to the study of the history and current situation of the main political parties, their platforms, ideological differences and achievements. This case includes as its objectives reflection on internal democracy, the relation between partisan ideas and government practices, the development and exercise of leadership and its limitations. As program content, it mentions matters such as the backgrounds, structure, ideology, leadership and financing of political parties; and as learning procedures it recommends the carrying out of research assignments, round tables, conferences and forums on

the practical operation of political parties in public functions, the opinions of their leaders on matters of national interests and the examination of electoral campaign speeches.

Finally, a single case was identified where the topics of administrative corruption and a lack of confidence in the judiciary are addressed as part of the study of democracy and political participation.

References to political and ideological pluralism, in contrast with the broad treatment of matters such as suffrage and electoral institutions, are much less frequent. In practice, this theme is handled more as a part of education in values than education for the practice of democracy.

The variations that have been briefly outlined here imply a trend in the modification of the concept of democracy in terms of its enrichment, from a manner of organization and government –in 1990- towards a practice in citizen participation –in 2003: from a purely legal matter, into a condition for the full exercise and defense of human rights; and from a matter concerning the public order, into a value that should be present in all attitudes and practices of everyday family and social life.

Examples of the objectives related to democracy in course programs	
1990	2003
<p><i>To analyze the structure of the State, its functions and importance for the consolidation of democracy</i></p> <p><i>To recognize the importance of exercising democracy in State politics</i></p> <p><i>To differentiate between the characteristics of the democratic and totalitarian systems of government</i></p> <p><i>To characterize democracy as a political system that allows the exercise of national sovereignty and the dignity of the human being</i></p> <p><i>To explain the concept, origin and historical evolution of democracy and its influence on civic life.</i></p> <p><i>To exercise the practice of the suffrage in school activities based on valid legal norms</i></p>	<p><i>To identify and analyze the diverse forms of citizen participation in a democratic society, with the purpose of favoring attitudes towards the defense and promotion of civil and political rights</i></p> <p><i>To encourage participation that fosters in young men and women the everyday practice of democracy and with it, a broader awareness of the importance of civic responsibilities</i></p> <p><i>To participate with a spirit of democracy, respect, solidarity and autonomy in the field of belonging, grounded on the fundamental principles of the National and Provincial Constitutions</i></p> <p><i>To identify the roles for citizen participation in social institutions and movements</i></p>



Examples of the contents related to democracy in course programs	
1990	2003
<p><i>To appreciate Greek democracy and other cultural manifestations disseminated by the Greeks.</i></p> <p><i>To perceive the importance of the process followed in the election of popular representatives.</i></p> <p><i>To understand the platforms of the registered political parties.</i></p> <p><i>To identify the roles of citizen participation in social institutions and movements.</i></p> <p><i>The age of democracy and nationalism.</i></p> <p><i>Democracy as a political system: Fundamental concepts, evolution and value.</i></p> <p><i>Electoral systems that were in force in the country from 1811 to 1945.</i></p> <p><i>Presidential election systems and deliberating bodies.</i></p> <p><i>Suffrage: as political right and civic duty; forms of election, direct and indirect; popular compulsory vote and voter identification; absentee vote; Electoral Law, analysis of its main articles.</i></p>	<p><i>The political practice of democracy and legal guarantees for the defense of human rights.</i></p> <p><i>Human Rights: Foundations of Democracy.</i></p> <p><i>Citizenship, rights and duties.</i></p> <p><i>Citizen participation. Decision making. Responsibilities. Consensus and Dissent.</i></p> <p><i>Democracy as a form of social organization, participation, decision making and commitment. Majority and minorities, power relations in social organization, conflict management and resolution.</i></p> <p><i>Citizenship: Concept and types.</i></p> <p><i>Debate regarding the themes of citizenship and democracy.</i></p> <p><i>Can discriminate between the characteristics and functions of different types of leadership.</i></p> <p><i>Civil society and citizenship: construction of democracy and of citizen participation. Subversion and pacification process.</i></p>

A first survey of the programs based on these indicators did not provide relevant information on the three matters that, as will be seen later in this report, have gained relevance over the past years: the political participation of women, political participation of indigenous peoples, and the growing importance of the participation of civil society organizations and social movements in public life.

It was difficult to recognize such references from a reading of the course programs. Rereading this same information, taking into account specific indicators from the cross-cutting perspectives, made it possible to correct this result.<sup>11</sup> However, there are some matters, such as the electoral participation of women and indigenous movements, that are already included in the legal and constitutional norms of the nineties, yet do not appear explicitly in the course programs.

The school textbooks reflect the same trends for progress over the past decade that we have already observed for the course programs. When comparing the sample for 1990 to that for 2003, the obvious phenomenon is the *expansion of the theme of democracy*, much more than any other theme analyzed up to this point in the Report.

The growth takes place on several dimensions. First, without a doubt it is conceptual. The definition and theoretical development of democracy is broadened according to the lines pointed

<sup>11</sup> These results are detailed in the following pages.

out above: the component of *representation of the popular will* is added to that of *active participation of the citizenry*; to the legal requirement of *respect for institutions* is added the ethic and social demand for *respect for the human rights of the entire population, without discrimination*; and to the democratic attitudes and conduct in *public life*, those pertaining to *private life* are added.

The conceptual expansion results in an expansion in language. The noun “democracy” and the adjective “democratic” applied to a variety of situations outside the political scope and start to appear throughout the textbooks –not only in the section pertaining to democracy. Often, the adjective is used in contrast to its opposite, in order to clarify all of the implications of the concept in the particular field to which it is being applied, for example: democratic relations between the sexes (in contrast to relations of domination of one sex over another); democratic family (versus authoritarian); democratic procedures (versus arbitrary or imposed without consultation); democratic school system (versus discriminatory), etc.

There is also an enriched methodology and didactic resources for approaching the subject in the textbooks. In spite of the great internal variation of these research sources, the textbooks for 2003 have a rather extensive concern with making education more practical and participative, in line with the new theoretical outlook on democracy. In the textbooks of many of the countries there are numerous individual and grade exercises and activities (before rare or inexistent) for children and youths to carry out individually or in groups, using a plethora of techniques different from traditional bibliographical search or the discussion of pre-selected documents. A few examples from the textbook samples for 2003 are: research on community organizations and political parties; interviews with people outside the school; analysis of messages in the news media; study and debate of current events; study of the lives of democratic leaders from the region; critical examination of the periods of dictatorship in the history of the country or the world in relation to massive human rights violations; and application to daily life of constitutional principles (freedom of opinion, of assembly, of association, etc.).

In at least one textbook an independent section was identified that focused on the relationship between democracy and education. It asserts that education for democracy is not learned only through a book or a school subject, but when it is translated into a mode of living. This idea, conveyed since the 1970s by the movement for informal and popular education in human rights, seems to be permeating the formal textbooks in the region and coincides with the drive in the textbooks themselves to “push” the students towards learning beyond the classroom.

## **Inclusion of content on education in values**

To educate in values appears as an explicit guideline in the documents regulating the curriculum in nine countries in 1990, and in twelve countries in 2003. In documents from other countries, a set of values that must be made part of the content is mentioned, but is not presented as a fundamental objective of the educating process. In contrast, as will be seen, this theme is developed in the course programs of 14 countries in 1990, and 18 countries in 2003.

In general terms, the references identified for 1990 entail instilling values in the students and the dominant perspective is that of moral and civic education. At least in three cases the values are explicitly associated with the Christian doctrine and, in one case, with democracy. Human dignity and solidarity amongst people are the most frequently mentioned values, followed by personal attributes such as responsibility, honesty, truthfulness, work and discipline. Peace, international cooperation and understanding among nations also have an important role.

By 2003, the number and variety of values mentioned have increased. The idea that the values are built through the educational process, primarily through practice, is introduced. There are new references to social values like equity, social justice, the common good, and recognition and respect for ethnic diversity. The references to Christian doctrine are much less explicit and there are frequent references to respect for political and religious options. New value concepts appear, such as environmental conservation, tolerance and conflict resolution. The references to solidarity and cooperation among nations as values increase considerably and some texts use concepts such as Pan Americanism and integration.

In the more recent versions, the perspective of *moral and civic* education tends to be replaced by *ethics and democracy*, a change that in some cases also affects the names of the corresponding subjects. In some documents, national identity and values are mentioned, although it is not specified which values would be considered to belong in this category.

From a review of the course programs, it is evident that education in values has, in most of the countries, an important place in the objectives and content in several subjects corresponding to the three grades analyzed. Certainly, in the programs for 1990 these contents are mostly confined to the subjects of Moral and Civic Education, whereas in 2003 they are found equally in those subjects (or their contemporary equivalent: Ethics and Democracy) and in other related subjects, such as Sociology, History, Philosophy and Social Sciences.

While the programs for 1990 lay out objectives for these subjects as eminently descriptive tasks that seek to transmit and promote values in the students, in 2003 the trend is toward the notion of values as an object of reflection, debate, comparison and recognition and it is recommended that activities and discussions about them be organized in the classroom about them.

Due to the amount and dispersion of the references to values that appear in the course programs of the 18 countries –whether as guidelines, objectives, content or means of evaluation– both for 1990 and 2003, it was not possible to establish them as a homogenous and systematic notion. From one country to another, and from one document to another, there is a great variation in the statements, depending on the context in which they are proposed. Moreover, not all of the numerous variables that are mentioned in the curriculum and in the course programs are directly associated with education in human rights and democracy, or rather, they cannot be considered as indicators of the willingness to incorporate these qualities to education.

The following examples may illustrate, on one hand, the types of statements found in the review of the materials and, on the other, their variation:

Examples of the values mentioned as objectives of the course programs in 1990			
Civic Values	Moral and Ethic Values	Solidarity and Cooperation	Peace
<i>To strengthen ethical and civic values to make it possible to act with responsibility and collaborative spirit for the benefit of national and universal society.</i>	<i>To practice in a conscious, critical and thoughtful manner the moral virtues and norms of politeness that contribute to his integral education.</i>	<i>To discover the need for behaving with solidarity among members of the community</i>	<i>To contribute to the promotion of peace, welfare and the autonomous development of all nations through the institutions that work at a global level in favor of such principles.</i>

Examples of values related to international cooperation in the course programs for 1990
<p><i>To identify the role of some international bodies for peaceful coexistence (Objective)</i></p> <p><i>The process of teaching and learning through education for peace (Content)</i></p> <p><i>World peace. Important actions undertaken and foreseen in favor of peace (Content)</i></p> <p><i>To recognize the efforts of the United Nations to maintain world peace (Objective)</i></p> <p><i>To understand the problems of American integration in order to achieve international peaceful coexistence (Objectives)</i></p> <p><i>Latin American Integration (Content)</i></p> <p><i>Through appropriate questions, induce students to express their feelings of love and loyalty for their Nation. Clarify that these manifestations must be channeled towards peace, mutual understanding and the development of the peoples of the America (Activities)</i></p>

Examples of values mentioned as objectives in the course programs for 2003
<p><i>To practice the values of respect, responsibility, tolerance, prudence and honesty in their school, family and social relations.</i></p> <p><i>To strengthen values such as responsibility and tolerance.</i></p> <p><i>To permanently display democratic behavior in everyday life by practicing solidarity, justice, tolerance and respect for the physical and moral integrity of persons and institutions.</i></p> <p><i>To practice tolerance and social harmony in actions with others.</i></p>

Examples of values mentioned as contents in the course programs for 2003
<p><i>Values for coexistence: Individual values and conditions: -Conditions and provisions of the individual that enable getting along with others: identity, individuality, valuing of one's own dignity and personal integrity, tolerance, cooperation, reciprocity, consideration and responsibility – The civic values and civic education: liberty, equality, equity, justice, respect, tolerance, solidarity, responsibility.</i></p> <p><i>Values for coexistence: The acceptance of individual and cultural differences among persons. The practice and diffusion of attitudes of acceptance of others and of rejection of discriminatory attitudes. Tolerance as a civic virtue. The concept and practice of social justice: recognition of rights and equal opportunity.</i></p> <p><i>The handling of conflicts through the search for understanding. Social institutions that promote peace.</i></p> <p><i>Human Values. Comradeship and solidarity. The respect for dignity and tolerance.</i></p> <p><i>Civic values of Costa Ricans: Community values: participation, justice, tolerance, solidarity, cultivation of peace, freedom and equality.</i></p>

In accordance with the formulas proposed in the international instruments, the values most often linked to human rights would be: solidarity, human dignity, peace, tolerance and understanding among nations. Out of these, solidarity and peace are mentioned in most of the programs since 1990. Tolerance and understanding between nations are incorporated more frequently in 2003. The issue of human dignity is found in all documents throughout the decade.

In school textbooks, the trends of variation summarized above for the course programs are repeated. However, they are magnified –both in their advances and in their limitations—due to the variety of philosophical and political visions of the authors. In this area in particular, there are greater discretionary margins than in others because the statements on values in the course programs tend to be succinct, and therefore the authors tend to further develop their own personal emphasis and focus.

There is no doubt that there has been progress. First of all, the generalized concern in 2003 for underscoring without exception the ethical and democratic values of *human dignity, freedom, justice, equity, solidarity, tolerance, mutual respect among people and towards the environment, peace and cooperation among nations*. These are truly human rights values, which in the sample for 1990 would appear in about two-thirds of the textbooks, but rarely in all of them.

Another sign of progress is the trend towards presenting values in the context of specific situations – to speak metaphorically, to “ground” them. To highlight just one case, there is the value of *human dignity*, which appears in the textbooks for 1990 and 2003. A decade ago, it was addressed more philosophically, and at times metaphysically; whereas today it is presented as directly associated to the concept of person and his/her inherent rights. Human dignity is manifested depending on whether (or not) human rights are respected in political, economic, social and cultural life.

Another advance is the trend towards showing and analyzing how values are materialized in the everyday attitudes and conduct of each person, and to what effect these have on the social setting (for example, being tolerant leads to recognizing and respecting the differences among persons, despite not sharing them; being intolerant leads to denying the legitimacy of these differences and undervaluing those who are different, which sooner or later leads to violating their rights). In

1990 values were generally presented as individual “virtues”; in 2003 they are shown as a category for analyzing (and evaluating) social attitudes and conduct. Many textbooks today develop concepts which a decade ago were rarely addressed in the classrooms of formal primary and secondary education (for example, prejudice, stereotypes, discrimination, racism, sexism, xenophobia, homophobia, pacifism, ecological movements, ethnic cleansing, apartheid, state terrorism, forced disappearances, war mongering, ethnocentrism, cultural universality and relativism, multiculturalism, interculturalism, etc.)

Nevertheless, the handling of values in school textbooks for 2003 has important limitations. As mentioned in assessing course programs, there is a profound variability, ambiguity, and lack of discrimination between human rights values and other personal traits (more or less desirable depending on how they are interpreted) but which do not have any relation to the dignity of the person as the subject of human rights (to mention a few examples drawn from 2003 textbooks: the attitude towards change, objectivity, leadership, creativity, work mystique, initiative and persistence, among others).

In synthesis, we believe that the development of this thematic axis within the school systems for the region is still weak and requires further theoretical and pedagogic reflection from a clear perspective of education in human rights.

## **Inclusion of content regarding gender equity**

The official documents at the highest level in terms of the curricula in force in 1990 record hardly any or no references to gender equity. In a very few countries the issue is tackled briefly when discussing the objectives sought by the educational system (even expressed as the “integral training of *man*”). Among them a brief reference is made, for example, to “promoting relations of equality and mutual respect between the sexes” (although in one case it is phrased as “*decency and loyalty* between the sexes”) and to “acquire knowledge and skills to manage the home, the care and education of children.” On very rare occasions, where equality among the sexes is mentioned, they are linked to Constitutional guarantees.

In 2003, the global outlook offered by the official documents is very different. Half the countries incorporate gender equity as an explicit, precise and substantive objective. At least six of them underscore it as a national policy that should permeate the whole educational system and be manifest in the classroom, giving it the category of a “national priority” (Mexico), “cross cutting axis or theme” (Bolivia, Brazil, El Salvador and Nicaragua) or a “generating axis” (Colombia).

It is important to emphasize that the documents that include a gender focus in one way or another clearly manifest that a major goal of education is to contribute to equal relationships and opportunities among people and to prevent and combat all forms of discrimination. This orientation towards preventing and confronting discrimination is a new component, which is seen to appear strongly in the guidelines of the educational policy. It was not present – at least not in an explicit and conclusive manner – in the documents in effect in 1990.

The specific references reported previously do not imply that the remaining countries in the scope of this investigation do not address the matter of gender or of non-discrimination. In truth, in 2003 practically all countries address it in some way; however, this becomes visible when moving to the next level of variables analyzed: the course programs. Here we have underscored its appearance in the main educational framework documents because it reveals how these principles of human rights are starting to be adopted as State policies and, therefore, as a general responsibility of educational systems, not simply as one more content to be taught in a given school grade.

The situation in the course programs shows the same variation trend, though more extensively. In 1990, there were a few isolated instances of a curriculum that mention the equality between men and women, and fewer still that referred to women’s rights. In 2003, at least two-thirds of the countries have incorporated these contents in one or more of the three grades analyzed. The thematic classification of the gender content is remarkably enriched. As in no other case, we see the examples, like the ones outlined in the following box, appearing as items for study or research practices.

The thematic items shown, which have been extracted from current programs in different countries in the region, illustrate how the study of gender issues is broadly permeating formal education. They also indicate that there is a growing concern to present these issues in their multiple dimensions (conceptual, historic, juridical, political, socioeconomic, cultural, etc.), as well as to develop awareness of the concrete implications in everyday lives (situations of discrimination, exclusion, mistreatment, etc.).

In this thematic field more than in the others studied, the curricular reforms present an important trend. It involves bridging the gap between the course programs and the reality of our societies, examining the issues that affect peaceful coexistence and proposing, as a way to overcome them, education in values and attitudes consistent with human rights. The trend is not absolute, but predominant and it is manifest increasingly as the more recently reformed course plans come into force.

Additionally, the efforts to promote gender equity in schools reflect on the preparation, on the part of the authorities, of specialized documents for guiding the work of educators. As an example, it is worth mentioning the guidebook “Hombres y Mujeres en la Escuela y el Trabajo. Estereotipos y Perspectiva de Género” *“Men and Women in School and Work. Stereotypes and Gender Perspective”* (optional guidebook for teachers, students and parents, Secretariat of Public Education, Mexico, 1988) and “Conceptos Básicos del Enfoque de Género en Educación” *“Basic Concepts of Gender Focus in Education”* and “Tratamiento del Eje Transversal Enfoque Integral de Género en la Educación” *“Treatment of the Cross-cutting Perspective of an Integral Focus in Gender in Education”* (Ministry of Education, Nicaragua, 1999).

A detailed survey of the textbooks confirms the pattern of change observed up to this point in the other domains, though even more widely spread in geographic terms. In 2003, slightly more than two-thirds of the countries have massively used textbooks that contain theory, practical exercises and illustrations sensitive to gender issues in some way. When contrasting them with the textbooks used in 1990, the changes are substantial at several levels.

As to the theory, a global analysis of content can be outlined by observing the main messages about women that are repeated in different textbooks, their frequency, contextualization and examples. Thus, it can be seen that the references about women in the textbooks for 1990 appear predominantly when the demographic composition of the country is addressed (as in census data) or when family, marriage, raising and education of children are discussed (where the role of women is very highly valued within the nuclear family as mother and caretaker of the children). In a few countries, in some of the grades analyzed, the textbook mentions the equal rights recognized by the Constitution, with an emphasis on suffrage and the historical event of the adoption of women’s right to vote.

Examples of content regarding gender in course programs for 2003
--

<i>The transformation in the social inclusion of women</i> <i>The roles of women in current society</i> <i>The Universal Declaration of Human Rights and the rights of women</i> <i>The presence of women in history,</i> <i>Achievements of men and women in (national and universal) history</i> <i>Female accomplishments in history</i> <i>Gender relations</i> <i>Gender stereotypes and discrimination</i> <i>Historical consequences of discriminatory attitudes</i> <i>Gender discrimination in everyday life</i> <i>Inter-family violence, and</i> <i>Challenges to increasing gender equity.</i>
---



Conversely, most textbooks for 2003 stop associating women exclusively with the equation “mother-family-children” and recognize their participation in many other aspects of national life – for example in history, from colonial to current times and include their active participation in the wars for independence; in the workplace and economic life, practicing a varied number of professions, and in political activity, not only as “suffragettes” but as leaders, candidates and elected officials. In short, their confinement in the realm of private activity is broken and have begun to become involved in public life.

At the same time, the analysis of the human rights of women is broadened, in many cases taking up whole units or chapters in some textbooks. National and international legal instruments that set out these rights are explained (for example, at the national level: anti-discrimination laws, sexual harassment laws, domestic violence laws, and those that establish female quotas for political parties; at the international level: the CEDAW Protocol and the conclusions of the Beijing Conference), as are the national institutions for protection. There are explicit grievances about modes of discrimination and rights violations –with both recent and past examples, defining in some cases the concepts of “machismo” (*male chauvinism*) and “sexism” – and changes are advocated in traditional relations of domination and abuse of women.

In terms of the language in which they are written, the books for 1990, without exception, use generic male-gender terms (non-inclusive language). Therefore, those playing roles in history, politics, science and all other areas of social life are always “the men,” and the male gendered description of the different professions. In the school, it is always “los maestros” (*the teachers*, a Spanish male gender noun), “los niños” (*the boys/children*, a Spanish male gender noun) and “los padres” (*the fathers/the parents*, a Spanish male gender noun).

The textbooks in force in 2003 show attempts –still incipient—to use a more sensitive language to gender differences, that equally covers men and women, but without rendering women invisible (inclusive language). The predominant way of doing this is with a greater use of alternative nouns to the traditional “man/men” such as *person/s*, *being/s*, *group/s*, *human/s*, *humanity*, or *society*. To a lesser degree, there are also textbooks that start to use both grammatical genders, whether jointly using both nouns (“*Dear boys and girls...*”, *etc.*), or a noun with double ending (*maestro/a*, *alumno(a)*, *etc.*) or the alternating use of the male and female article and noun “los...” (*male first person plural*) and “las...” (*female first person plural*).

With regard to the images that illustrate the textbooks, in 1990 the prevailing images are those that show women in the roles of housewife, wife and mother, carrying out domestic and childcare activities. This is the case for women of Hispanic origin as well as for indigenous or Afro-descendant women, although the latter are only present in a small number of cases. However, some textbooks can be found which depict a broader range of roles (heroines of the independence, writers, educators, and other professions). There is some visibility given to certain prominent women from national history (in Paraguay, for their participation in the Triple Alliance War, and in Chile, to the Nobel Poet Laureate Gabriela Mistral, to cite just two examples).

In 2003, all of the re-edited or new books following curricular reforms include images where the female roles are much broader, even central. The women are shown in a diversity of occupations: different professions, commerce, solidarity and public functions, among them elected offices and as members of the armed forces and law enforcement bodies – in addition to the traditional home roles, approaching a balance with male depictions. In some cases, there are images of men doing

domestic and childcare functions, to reinforce the theoretical concepts of equality and non-discrimination.

Several books use drawings of boys and girls together to guide the readers through the text, underscoring the main ideas and giving instructions for the practical exercises. Sometimes, they are characters, identified by their names and personal characteristics. The visibility of prominent persons is also increased, among which are some national figures and other international ones (such as Olimpia de Gouges, Virginia Woolf, Rigoberta Menchú and Mother Theresa).

In terms of the number of women depicted in the images in comparison with the number of men, in 1990 the proportion is very uneven. A global estimate indicates that out of the total of photographs and drawings of persons, only about 10% to 20% correspond to women. In 2002/03 a greater balance is visible, female images tend to represent between 40% and 50% of the total.

In synthesis, we conclude that in the past decade the gender equity perspective has gained breadth and depth in all the domains of the education system analyzed by this report. The manifestations found to date suggest that a large number of the region's States are starting to incorporate it and promote it through education in schools. Several factors doubtlessly influenced the introduction of the theme in the educational agendas, among them the constant activism of the women's civil organizations; the new laws and public agencies that have emerged to protect the rights of women, and at the international level, the agreements in the World Conferences of this decade, in particular those on Human Rights (Vienna, 1993), on Population and Development (Cairo, 1994), on Social Development (Copenhagen, 1995) and above all on Women and Development (Beijing, 1995). Although the progress is uneven and needs to be generalized and strengthened, the trend is auspicious for the progress of HRE.

### **Inclusion of content regarding ethnic diversity**

In the official documents that regulate the curriculum for primary and secondary education in 1990, with few exceptions the matter of ethnic diversity does not appear clearly related to a focus on rights, or it is found in generic statements that allude to educational goals and a school system “free of discrimination based on *sex, race, ethnic origin, religion*, etc.” In comparison, the similar documents for 2003 include this theme in an explicit and precise manner in at least 13 countries.

In recent statements, some new elements appear repeatedly, for example:

- The notion of diversity (racial, ethnic and/or cultural) seen under a positive light, such as the enrichment of society;
- The manifestation of ethnic diversity in contemporary societies in the Americas, beyond just references to the pre-Columbian and European conquest periods;
- The recognition of the current problems regarding rights associated with diversity: at the economic-political level, inequality in living conditions and opportunities as a consequence primarily of the European conquest and subsequently of marginality; at the socio-cultural level, the prejudice and discrimination that persists towards ethnic groups not of European origin; and
- The purpose of teaching the value of tolerance, understood as the respect of differences (including ethnic differences) and the struggle against discrimination.

Notwithstanding these common elements, the spread and intensity with which diversity is approached as a curricular objective varies among the countries, according to their population, composition and history. The countries that propose it with greater breadth and emphasis (for example, Brazil, Paraguay, all the Andean nations, Guatemala, Mexico and the Dominican Republic) have high percentages of indigenous and/or Afro-descendant population, and also have a significant tradition of social thinking and movements for the defense of the rights of these ethnically diverse populations. In several of them, the issue is addressed in special education laws or documents, and in eight of them it has a position of priority as a *cross-cutting axis, theme or content of the curriculum* (Brazil, Ecuador, Guatemala, the Dominican Republic, Mexico, Nicaragua, Paraguay and Peru).

In those cases, education policies start by defining their own societies as bi/multi-cultural and bi/multi-lingual, recognizing that ethnic diversity constitutes a great asset, and that it is at the foundation of national identity, and must therefore be respected and protected by the State.

Several of these strongly multi-ethnic countries, during the past decade, created (or strengthened) regular programs of bilingual and bi-cultural/inter-cultural education, generally directed at the regions where the indigenous populations reside. The languages of the bilingual programs are, in one case, Spanish and in the other, one or more indigenous languages (for example, Guaraní in Paraguay; Quechua and Aymara in Peru, with some dialect variations; in Mexico, 26 out of the 60 indigenous languages spoken in the country, etc.). For populations of African descent, only one case has been identified of bilingual education in their mother tongue, (in Nicaragua, where the program for the Atlantic Coast incorporates Creole English on a par with the indigenous languages Misquito and Sumo-Mayagna.).

The course programs for 2003 have also advanced with regard to those for 1990 in the manner in which the theme is presented conceptually. The overall outlook shows two trends, though once again, with varying magnitudes among the different countries.

The first trend is more manifest: *the content referring to indigenous peoples and people of African descent cease to be confined to the historical past of the American continent and start looking at the present.* In 1990, the vast majority of content was historical-anthropological. It made reference to pre-Columbian civilizations, European conquest, colonization, slavery; the population makeup of the country (demographic data) and, in some cases, expressions of national folklore (holidays, food, legends, popular music and dance, etc.) In 2002/03, many course programs move beyond history and folklore to address current economic, social and cultural issues – for example, the status of these populations concerning production and the economy, the distribution of wealth, land tenure, poverty, world vision, language/s, and their contributions to national culture.

The second trend is incipient, and applies to a minority of cases: *the emerging approach to ethnic diversity from a human rights and citizenship perspective.* This is visible in some of the countries with larger indigenous populations and a history of struggle for the rights of these populations. Here, content includes the right to ethnic and cultural identity; the rights of indigenous peoples; international instruments that set out these rights; historical violations of the rights of indigenous peoples and people of African descent, such as racism and discrimination; national indigenous associations and public institutions that defend the equal rights of all citizens. An idea/synthesis repeatedly stated to encompass these themes is “*unity in diversity*” – national unity recognizing the multi-ethnic composition of the country.

With the broadening of content, the distribution of the information across the grades of the school system tends to be expanded as well: in 1990 it is found mostly in the 5<sup>th</sup> grade and, somewhat, in the 8<sup>th</sup> grade; in 2003 it is frequently found in the 5<sup>th</sup>, 8<sup>th</sup> and 11<sup>th</sup> grades.

These advancements are very significant, but they are still not generalized. The more progressive objectives of the general education framework documents do not correspond to the course contents for the grades studied.

Part of this lag may be due to the recent nature of the changes in the curricular directives about this theme in most countries, and that the new course programs might still be being prepared, or not in force yet. (It is important to remember that reforms in course programs tend to be slow and are implemented on a scaled basis, starting with the lower grades and moving gradually towards the higher grades, so that it takes several years for them to be instituted into the overall school system).

Moreover, it is neither swift nor simple to turn broad, innovative objectives into content and methodologies for the classroom. It is necessary to undergo processes of open discussion among the stakeholders –for example, educational authorities, educators and the indigenous or Afro-descendant communities of each country—on pedagogic design, evaluations and adjustments.

In the textbooks the trend is similar to that of the course programs. During the decade, the presentation of the themes shows progress; although at present most still do not match the vast objectives stated in the curricular documents of the last educational reforms. In 1990, the textbooks in general mentioned the great Inca, Aztec and Maya pre-Columbian civilizations; other indigenous peoples; the arrival of African slaves; the impact of the European conquest and some aspects of the situations of these populations, acknowledging them as sources of national traditions. In isolated cases, wording that devalues the indigenous cultures in relation to the

European conquerors were found. Any other references, aside from the historic overview, are scant –with the exception of those countries where the course programs already had some contents on diversity. In those latter cases, the textbooks include information on national ethnic diversity and acknowledge its value.

In 2003, the overall situation of the textbooks is very uneven. A significant share of them maintain the historical-folklore depiction of indigenous peoples, with occasional comments on ethnic diversity as such, and of the illegality of discrimination. At the opposite end, there are some textbooks that present an updated and detailed analysis, devoting entire sections to this topic.

In general, the populations of African descent are mentioned much less than the indigenous populations, both in 1990 and in 2003. In relation to other populations, only one book was found that proposes to the students an activity for researching information about the Chinese families living in their community, their activities and traditions (the Dominican Republic). Considering the large migrations of Latin American history during the 19th and 20th centuries, the absence of references to other ethnic groups in the schools is surprising.

Although they are still not in the majority, it is illustrative to highlight the aspects of the more detailed textbooks that incorporate HRE concepts and values in addressing the topic. (See the following box):

Examples of content on ethnic diversity in school textbooks for 2003
<p><i>Ethnic diversity as a component of national identity</i></p> <p><i>Intercultural aspects and dialogue among cultures</i></p> <p><i>The value of tolerance in the face of the social risks of prejudice, intolerance, fanaticism, racism, and xenophobia</i></p> <p><i>The fight against all types of intolerance and discrimination</i></p> <p><i>The values of equality, justice, equity in the face of exclusion, social injustice, economic, social and cultural inequity</i></p> <p><i>National legislation that sets out and protects equality (Constitution and law) and specific international instruments (International Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Racial Discrimination)</i></p> <p><i>Examples of intolerance in the world: nazism, anti-Semitism and the holocaust, the Klu Klux Klan; ethnic conflicts in Africa; Apartheid; the discrimination of foreigners in Europe and the Skinheads; the Balkans war; State terrorism in Latin America</i></p> <p><i>Presence of some non-Hispanic figures in the textbooks (scant): Rigoberta Menchú, the most often displayed from among current personalities, an indigenous boy of the Mbya community within a group of boys and girls that guide the practice exercises in a textbook in Paraguay</i></p>

The variation of images of indigenous and Afro-descendant people in textbooks is hard to quantify. There are many History, Geography and Social Studies textbooks that do not contain any images at all, or that do not have them on this topic. The observations were very uneven for the different countries and textbooks. The national reports indicate that in some cases non-Hispanic ethnic groups are made invisible; that in others there is an increase in their presence; and yet in others no change. Estimating an average figure, there seems to be a slight increase in the decade in the images of indigenous people, of about 5% to 10%. People of African descent are

depicted very rarely, with the exception of those countries where they make up a substantial share of the population.

The role of indigenous people and people of African-descent in images merits a special comment. We observe that, despite the slight increase in the number of images, the predominant roles continue to be traditional, the same that were depicted last decade, and long before then. They are still shown in scenes from the pre-Columbian and European conquest ages (hunting with bows and arrows, building huts, making offerings to the conquerors, suffering torture, being converted by missionaries, at war, etc.) In current images, they are depicted performing folk dances, at the carnival, tending the fields, weaving, and selling products in popular markets. The images where they are depicted in roles of political participation and leadership are very scant (there are examples of one election, a public demonstration, and an occasional isolated community leader).

Present day indigenous women are depicted mostly in agricultural and domestic labors, or trading in the markets. At least within the materials consulted, there were no references, neither in writing nor as images, to a combined treatment of the issues of gender and ethnic diversity.

People of African descent are predominantly depicted as slaves, servants, dancing, selling artisanal products and as examples of extreme poverty or malnutrition.

Here is another case of lag between curriculum objectives and pedagogic tools in the classroom that should be corrected. The fact that indigenous, Afro-descendant, or populations of any other ethnic origin are not being depicted in varied current participative and leadership roles, on a par with people of Hispanic origin, does not reinforce the educational proposals of equity and interculturalism. On the contrary, this can contribute to perpetuating racial stereotypes. It is true that equity is not the norm in today's Latin American reality. However, a historic turning point does exist in which opportunities and advancements have mainly derived from the mobilization of the affected populations themselves, in the world and in our continent. Not showing these advances is hiding part of the reality; it is ignoring their dynamism and actions to change this reality.

As to the existence of complementary bibliography and specialized texts, which was scant in 1990, an important increase as of 2003 in at least nine of the countries studied, precisely those countries that have bilingual and bicultural/intercultural school systems, or which incorporated ethnic diversity as a cross-cutting perspective. (They are listed in detail in the Annexes to this Report).

There are different types of complementary documents, for example those which provide pedagogic guidance for educators; translations to indigenous languages of didactic and literary materials, and bilingual and bicultural textbooks. The latter category currently covers the lower grades of primary education, but is gradually being developed to progressively cover the remaining grades. These stand out for being very recent editions, mostly released in 2000 and after.

Many of the changes that have been seen on this topic, in this decade are very recent, from the end of the 1990s and early 2000s. A factor that may contribute to speed up educational reform in this regard is the international momentum resulting from the **World Conference against Racism, Racial Discrimination, Xenophobia and Related Intolerance** held in Durban in 2001. It is hoped that this initiative continue and become more coherent in the coming years.

## **Inclusion of content regarding the interaction between civil society and the State**

The vast majority of official documents at the macro level in force in 1990 do not address the participation of civil society entities in the design of the school curriculum. In at least 11 countries of the region, no explicit policies are found in this regard –with the exception of Mexico, that in 1989 held a broad national consultation on the modernization of education.

In the remaining countries a certain degree of intervention of civil society stakeholders is considered in some limited areas: for example, *members of indigenous communities* in the special curriculum for their own communities (Colombia); the *non-governmental sector in educational projects and programs* (El Salvador), and *parents and other members of the community* in a specific subject (“Family Education,” 8<sup>th</sup> grade, Peru).

In several other cases the contribution of parents is noted, but restricted to marginal activities of the education process, such as improving school facilities, raising funds, supporting extra-curricular activities, protecting the safety of children and meeting with teachers (Bolivia, in the 1955 law). This space reserved for the family in relation to the school has a long history in Latin America. It is in the framework of this space that the traditional Cooperation or Parents Associations used to operate, without having any impact on curricular or management aspects, which were the sole province of the Ministries or State Secretariats for Education.

At the start of the past decade the prevailing concept was still that of curricular development as a technical task, reserved for specialists and national education authorities, whose results were applied uniformly to the country’s entire student population.

By 2003, public policies on preparation and implementation of the school curriculum have shifted substantially. Based on the principle that education is a shared responsibility of all the social sectors, at present at least 15 countries incorporate, in one way or another, different stakeholders from civil society in educational decision making, including curriculum issues.

In almost every case, those who receive the greatest recognition are the stakeholders from within the educational system (beyond the highest echelons that have historically played the role) from *the provincial and district authorities, to the principals and faculty of the institutions*, and in some cases, *the students themselves* are mentioned. The next most frequently mentioned sector are *parents and the local community*, represented in the generic sense, or as *local community organizations*.

Furthermore, about two-thirds of the countries mention the participation of other national stakeholders –*non-governmental organizations, private enterprise, labor and professional organizations, universities*, etc. In some cases, *international bodies* are included.

Participation of civil society stakeholders in the educational process may vary, as with the strategies set forth to direct this participation. However, two trends are most broadly noted, often simultaneously.

One instance is the emergence of a policy of giving school establishments relative autonomy in preparing more democratic, flexible and diversified curricular proposals, according to the needs and demands of their local reality. Therefore, the first set of stakeholders, conceived as an *educational community*, can intervene in certain centralized decisions – which may affect, depending

on the case, the content of the course programs, methodologies, time distribution, and/or management and evaluation criteria (for example, in Colombia, Brazil, Peru, Chile, Paraguay and Argentina, among others). This trend is related to specific pedagogic proposals for a single school, like the case of so-called Institutional Education Projects-PEI, or Facility Projects and Classroom Projects.

On the other hand, broader national consultation process on education reform and/or education development plans take place (or are strengthened) on a five- or ten-year timeframe. The State shows an interest in systematically promoting the participation of a wide variety of social sectors in order to gather their concerns and recommendations on educational policies and services and incorporate them into the country's strategic planning concerning education (for example in Mexico, Paraguay, the Dominican Republic, among others). Within this trend, specific mechanisms are promoted, such as the National Educator Congresses or initiatives to attract the contribution of private enterprise to education.

The outlined changes are made official in the more recent documents, from 2000 and subsequent years. In summary, they point towards the decentralization and territorial diversification of curricular and administrative decisions, and to the joint participation in them of national institutions along with different social stakeholders.

About one-third of the course programs in force in 1990 make some reference to the participation of civil society in national life. The references encountered focus on two areas:

(a) Democracy, understood as the form of political organization and its procedures for electing authorities who are representative of the popular will. The emphasis is placed on the structure of the powers of the State, the electoral process, citizen participation through suffrage—the latter aspect being very strongly promoted.

In a few cases, to a much lesser degree, the political parties are mentioned. Very rarely, references are made to authoritarian periods of the country's history in which the direct action of the population was a determining factor in the recovery of democracy (for example, the socio-cultural movements of resistance to the military regime in Brazil or to the Trujillo dictatorship in the Dominican Republic)

(b) Public welfare organizations that act in the community, and particularly in the schools (for example, most often quoted are: cooperation associations, mothers' centers, neighborhood boards, cooperatives, professional associations, civil defense organizations, firemen, the Red Cross, the Boy and Girl Scouts, public works societies, public libraries, cultural associations, sports clubs and student centers, when these exist).

In this field, the objectives of education encourage solidarity through citizen participation in collective actions for public defense in the event of natural, accidental or provoked disasters, and in mutual support organizations for finding solutions to community problems, with a primary focus on *volunteer work*.

By 2003, most of the course programs surveyed show an important quantitative and qualitative leap in relation to the previous decade. As a whole, they are characterized for presenting citizen participation in a broader light, considered in the context of a greater number of thematic contents, with an explicit *focus on human rights and peaceful coexistence values*. This is visible in the new contents that are present repeatedly in a large number of countries, as illustrated by the following examples:



Examples of content related to civil society in the course programs for 2003
<p><i>Importance of citizen participation for the strengthening of democratic institutions and the control of the government's actions</i></p> <p><i>Mechanisms for democratic participation in the national law (for example, as these exist in the country: vote, plebiscite, referendum, popular consultation, legislative initiative, open town council, mandate revocation/recall, etc.)</i></p> <p><i>Democracy as a life style or culture</i></p> <p><i>Human rights. Legal mechanisms and instruments for their promotion and defense</i></p> <p><i>Rights of assembly, association and participation</i></p> <p><i>The different forms of social participation: personal, group or collective</i></p> <p><i>Collective forms of social participation: labor unions and non-governmental organizations</i></p> <p><i>The values of peaceful coexistence, mutual respect in shared life, the practice of solidarity, cooperative work</i></p>

Aside from this conceptual broadening, some countries offer a more integral outlook, linking the approach to rights and promotion of values with the practice of *competencies for action*. Thus, they include in their programs activities such as:

- *Research on local and national non-governmental organizations: functions and activities*
- *Research on contemporary problems that affect community life (violence, poverty, environment and natural resources, corruption)*
- *Community service activities and action projects with regard to relevant social problems*

It can be expected (and it is also very advisable from the perspective of human rights education) that over the coming years this integrated perspective will become more widespread in the region.

As has been pointed out, due to the nature of textbooks, there are great differences in depth in the treatment of this topic, derived undoubtedly from the personal viewpoint of the authors.

Nevertheless, as a whole, the textbooks analyzed for 1990 and 2003 tend to correspond with the contents of the current course programs. At the start of the decade, electoral participation and volunteering in welfare organizations were mostly singled out; currently the activities of non-governmental organizations –among the most often mentioned are environmental, consumer protection, human rights and those organizations that defend the rights of specific populations (particularly women, children, indigenous peoples and people with some form of disability).



## **Section III**

### **Conclusions**

The first part of this Report,<sup>12</sup> regarding the adoption of norms and public policies on HRE, corroborated that from 1990 to 2002 there had been important progress made in the ratification of international instruments related to this field; that such ratifications gave rise to the inclusion or reform of some constitutional precepts; and that in a growing number of countries, the establishment of human rights education as a fundamental component of education was beginning to be reflected in the provisions of general education laws and other legal instruments. This phenomenon coincides with the educational reform that has been undertaken since the second half of the 1990s and has begun to take effect in some countries.

From a review of the documents that reflects educational policies, the institutional development for the establishment of HRE and the existence of programs or projects to bring it into effect, show that there has been a favorable evolution in terms of the efforts undertaken, mainly in the last two years of the period surveyed. However, it was also evident that for the most part, these efforts were widely dispersed, single episode events –like the operation of temporary specialized commissions and the implementation of pilot projects – with scant participation of civil organizations, which have extensive experience in HRE, and relatively dependent on the support and initiatives of the international community rather than being driven by national policy.

The next level of this investigation should address the situation of contents dealing with human rights and democracy in the instruments used in the day-to-day organization of educational processes: curriculum guidelines, course programs and textbooks.

This Second Report has found some trends and characteristics, which are described in the following paragraphs.

#### ***General assessment***

The combined results of the studies carried out in 2002 and 2003 on the state of human rights education in the countries that have signed the Protocol of San Salvador can be regarded as encouraging, as they show a positive trend towards the progressive undertaking of legal, institutional and pedagogic measures to endow education with the qualities that are stated in Article 13 of the Protocol. This development is, however, very uneven across the region, not only in terms of the number of contents integrated, but also relatively the ways in which these contents are addressed. In particular, a cause for concern is the high level of theoretical dispersion in their definition and, therefore, in the methodological and pedagogic consequences derived from them.

#### ***On legal and curriculum reform***

The study confirms that before 1990 some basic contents were already present in the pedagogic instruments analyzed, primarily in the course programs. This is particularly interesting, considering that the constitutional and legal reforms that promote these contents took place subsequent to this date in most of the countries. This fact reveals the existence of a reform

---

<sup>12</sup> Published in December 2002 and included in the Annex of this Second Report. A summary of its conclusions may be found in Section I of this Report.

movement, in support of the inclusion of these contents, that has probably been building from the times of the recuperation of democracy in the region and that somehow has pushed for these reforms.

In general, the changes identified between 1990 and 2003 –as detailed in the following paragraphs—concern mostly the quality and the range across the curriculum, and are most clearly visible in the textbooks. Unlike in 1990, by 2003 the development of some of the themes is lagging slightly behind the legal and policy context, taking into account the most recent international instruments and declarations – such as the Inter-American Democratic Charter, the Convention against Corruption or the recommendations of the Durban Conference against racism, xenophobia and discrimination; as well as the legislation that establishes innovative constitutional precepts such as the relative autonomy of indigenous peoples in some of the countries or the broadening of decentralization.

Some emerging themes in the area of human rights and democracy, like the problems regarding people's safety in the face of organized crime, the impact of free trade, the reconfiguring of global powers or the problems deriving from transnational crime have not been integrated into the documents and textbooks, and it is not possible to know whether and how they are being discussed in the classroom.

### ***On human rights and guarantees***

Throughout the decade, the references to human rights and fundamental guarantees have grown in the the curriculum, in the course programs and textbooks. This trend is characterized by certain features: in all the sources analyzed for 2003, the inclusion is much more explicit than for 1990; there is a progression from the notion of civil and political rights to the concept of economic, social and cultural rights, and in some countries, environmental and other more recently formulated rights are also addressed. A perspective on social rights is also introduced that offsets the emphasis on individual rights that existed in 1990. In the course programs for Colombia (2003) international humanitarian law and the International Red Cross are given special attention.

Both in 1990 and 2003, the issue of human rights and fundamental guarantees is regarded as a component –a very significant one, in fact—of the study of the Constitution, its principles and contents. This highlights an important limitation: a lack of clarity in the relationship between the regime of constitutional rights and guarantees and the development of human rights standards at the international level. Apparently, this diminishes the purpose of studying the Universal Declaration –included in most course programs– and renders the study of international organizations a merely formal exercise, since it cuts this topic off from the issue of rights and weakens the recognition of the international mechanisms for protection, which are seen merely as institutions.

### ***On the State, the Rule of Law, and Justice***

The study of the nature, structure and functioning of the State, of some public institutions and the national legal system is included in the documents, programs and/or textbooks of all countries for 1990 and 2003. The coverage of this theme is very uneven in terms of breadth and depth for each country, but overall the array of issues covered can be regarded as helpful in instilling a sense of belonging to the nation and guiding the conduct of citizens in public life.

Between 1990 and 2003, the programs and textbooks were updated to reflect the changes introduced over the decade – mainly in terms of constitutional reforms. In several cases a greater emphasis is placed on promoting the students' regard for the balance of powers, the functions of the State and government in securing equitable social and economic development, and the importance of legality for peaceful coexistence. In less than a quarter of the countries, the concept of the rule of law is used to refer to these concepts of balance and legality. In a similar number of countries, the themes of decentralization, local government and direct citizen participation in public administration are introduced in detail.

References to justice are abundant. It is presented as something of value and an objective of the State and its institutions, and to a lesser degree as a means that the citizens can turn to for conflict resolution. The study of judicial bodies and other mechanisms is covered as part of the State's structure, but an emphasis in training on the access to justice is not visible in the documents. Conversely, relevant information is included on the Ombudsman institutions, a few of the other bodies of government control and two basic appellate procedures for protection, habeas corpus and amparo.

With the exception of one country, where administrative corruption is mentioned, nothing was found regarding the problems that affect the stability and optimum performance of the State's structure and its potential solutions.

### *On democracy*

Democracy as a value, as a form of government and as an attribute of institutions, social practices and personal life is mentioned repeatedly in the documents examined for 1990 and 2003. The important modifications throughout these years are in relation to the concept of democracy as a practice, and not solely as a system; and with the growing integration of the idea of citizen participation in democracy, not merely limited to elections and the exercise of political parties and their leaders.

Electoral bodies are studied, in 1990 and 2003, as a part of the structure of the State. National elections are discussed in scant detail, although in some countries student governments and associations are suggested as an opportunity to instill democratic practices.

The issues of national political parties, their characteristics, their platforms, their history and their internal functioning are addressed extensively in only one country. In others, some references are made to the political party as an element of democracy, while the subject of political trends and ideologies is primarily dealt with through historical perspectives.

No contents on governance, transparency or accountability have been introduced as yet.

### *On values*

The evolution of the educational documents on this subject, between 1990 and 2003, is characterized by the progressive inclusion of statements on values, increasingly more diverse and emphatic. A visible trend is the transition from values that affect individual conduct to those affecting social and democratic coexistence, from values that are induced to those that are constructed and practiced. Whereas the dominant perspective in 1990 was in moral and civic terms, in 2003 the dominant perspective is that of ethics and democracy.

The growing importance given to the values of peaceful coexistence between nations and international solidarity is also worth noting. However, this is not accompanied by a discussion of relevant problems in the international sphere, a matter that might be left up to classroom practices—in the sense of what is known as the hidden curriculum.

### *On gender equity*

One of the most remarkable achievements, in practically every country in this study, is the inclusion of the gender equity perspective. In comparing the whole array of official documents, course plans and textbooks for 1990 to the ones for 2003, a significant development is evident, both qualitatively and quantitatively. The quantitative growth is manifest in the increase in specific contents on the topic and their presence in a greater number of grades. The qualitative improvement is in the sense that the subject is approached in a more extensive and in-depth manner.

Although there are still disparities in the breadth and manner in which the issue is addressed in the different countries, it is important to underscore that, within each country, the last decade brought about a very positive evolution in the attitude towards equal rights for men and women in the educational system.

### *On ethnic diversity*

Another development that stands out during the past decade in the educational systems of the countries subject to this Report is the greater recognition and valuation of racial or ethnic diversity. Out of the total data for 1990, in comparison with 2003, the following prominent trends are observed: (a) more explicit, emphatic, and non-discriminatory curriculum objectives, (b) more extensive contents that address current issues, and (c) a significant number of national initiatives directed at specific populations—mostly indigenous peoples—that seek to empower their right to an education that respects their own language and culture. The development regarding communities of African descent is still very sparse.

### *On civil society*

In order to examine whether, and how, participation by civil society is integrated into the educational systems in the region, two complementary perspectives were used. First, an assessment was made of the procedures used to prepare and implement the educational curriculum in the different countries. Secondly, the symbolic representations transmitted to the students through the educational system (the curriculum and the textbooks) were analyzed as reflections on the interpretations of the reality. From both perspectives, significant variations were found that indicate an enhanced presence and valuation of the many stakeholders from civil society that interact with the State.

## **Section IV**

### **Recommendations**

- To encourage a joint effort by all the countries, including their Ministries of Education, their educators associations and civil society organizations to share and discuss the state of incorporation of human rights in education, with the objective of developing collective standards that build on the successes achieved and the lessons learned over the past decade. The National Human Rights Education Commissions, already existing in many countries, can play a key role in achieving this objective.
- To mobilize the support of the Inter-American Court, Commission and Institute of Human Rights to complement the efforts of the countries, especially in the preparation of proposals that adequately and practically promote the familiarity of the students with the fundamental content of the inter-American instruments and mechanisms for the defense of human rights.
- To encourage the networks of electoral bodies and Ombudsman institutions to participate actively in the discussion and formulation of common pedagogic instruments for the region, in order to reinforce the knowledge and practice of democracy and the defense of human rights.
- To consider the establishment of permanent mechanisms –like the Human Rights Education Commissions – that can assist in keeping the education programs up to date and in producing pedagogic materials that respond to the new challenges and emerging problems concerning human rights and democracy in a world that is increasingly becoming integrated through electronic information and the communications media.
- To address, in systematic manner, the incorporation of human rights education contents and methodologies into the process of instructing the professionals who work as educators, including teacher colleges and universities.

The IIHR shall continue to offer its assistance to those Ministries of Education interested in perfecting their programs for human rights education. It shall continue to produce this annual report on human rights education and it hopes to be able to derive from this process new insights and resources that can contribute to overcoming the limitations and to filling the gaps in this field.





## Annex on CD-Rom

In the attached CD, you will be able to find the First Inter-American Report on Human Rights Education, Spanish and English versions, and its annexes, as well as the Second Inter-American Report on Human Rights Education, regarding the development of the curriculum and school textbooks, also in the Spanish and English language versions, along with its annexes.

The Annex to the First Report contains the data used for the preparation of that report. Furthermore, you will be able to consult an abstract of the selected international instruments that refer to Human Rights Education.

In the Annex to the Second Report you can consult the data used as sources for the preparation of this Second Report.

The first part deals with the contents on human rights, constitutional guarantees, justice, the Rule of Law, State institutions, democracy, suffrage, elections, political and ideological pluralism, and values.

The second part deals with gender equity. The third part addresses ethnic diversity and the fourth part tackles the interaction between civil society and the State.

In all cases, these contents are analyzed based on the official documents that set forth the objectives and contents of the curriculum; and from a sample of course programs and textbooks.

When starting the CD and following the instructions, you will be able to find inside the annexes, tables similar to the following ones, that will allow you to accede the information of the indicator or Country that you select.

In each table, you may consult all of the indicators for a given country; the information for all 19 countries regarding a specific indicator; or the information for an actual indicator in a particular country.



The screenshot shows the 'Informe Interamericano de la educación en derechos humanos >> Anexos' section. It features a table with 19 columns representing countries and 10 rows representing different indicators. The indicators are listed on the left, and the countries are listed at the top. The table cells contain black squares indicating the presence of data for each country-indicator pair.

Informe Interamericano de la Educación en Derechos Humanos	Argentina	Bolivia	Brazil	Colombia	Costa Rica	Chile	Ecuador	El Salvador	Guatemala	Haiti	México	Nicaragua	Paraguay	Peru	Rep. Dominicana	Suriname	Uruguay	Venezuela
Instrumentos internacionales relativos a los derechos humanos	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■
Norma Constitucional que establece el derecho a la educación y la EDH	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■
Educación en derechos humanos en la Ley general de educación	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■
Educación en derechos humanos en otras leyes nacionales	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■
Algunas disposiciones de carácter ejecutivo sobre educación en derechos humanos	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■
Variación en planes de educación y documentos de reforma educativa	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■
Unidades y dependencias especializadas en derechos humanos en el sector público	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■
Programas específicos sobre educación o capacitación en derechos humanos dentro de otros ministerios o dependencias	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■
Variación del porcentaje constitucional del presupuesto para la educación en relación con el presupuesto nacional	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■

## Contenidos en el documento oficial que fija los objetivos y contenidos del currículo, en los Programas de Estudio y en los Textos Escolares

	Argentina	Bolivia	Brasil	Colombia	Costa Rica	Chile	Ecuador	El Salvador	Guatemala	Haití	México	Nicaragua	Panamá	Paraguay	Perú	Rep. Dominicana	Suriname	Uruguay	Venezuela
Sobre DDHH y Garantías Constitucionales	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●
Sobre justicia, estado de derecho e instituciones del Estado	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●
Sobre democracia, derechos al voto, elecciones, pluralismo político e ideológico	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●
Sobre valores	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●


Para ver los documentos, haga click en los puntos, en el nombre de las filas o en el nombre de las columnas

I Informe

Anexos, I Informe

II Informe

Anexos, II Informe



Contenidos sobre Equidad de Género

	Argentina	Bolivia	Brasil	Colombia	Costa Rica	Chile	Ecuador	El Salvador	Guatemala	Haití	México	Nicaragua	Panamá	Paraguay	Perú	Rep. Dominicana	Suriname	Uruguay	Venezuela
En el documento oficial que fija los objetivos y contenidos del currículo	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●
En los programas de estudio	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●
En los textos educativos	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●
Lenguaje que se utiliza en los textos educativos	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●
Rol que ocupa la mujer en las imágenes de los textos educativos	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●
Número de mujeres en relación a los hombres que se observa en las imágenes de los textos educativos	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●

Para ver los documentos, haga click en los puntos, en el nombre de las filas o en el nombre de las columnas

▲

I Informe

Anexos, I Informe

II Informe

Anexos, II Informe



Contenidos sobre Diversidad Étnica

	Argentina	Bolivia	Brasil	Colombia	Costa Rica	Chile	Ecuador	El Salvador	Guatemala	Haití	México	Nicaragua	Panamá	Paraguay	Perú	Rep. Dominicana	Suriname	Uruguay	Venezuela
En el documento oficial que fija los objetivos y contenidos del currículo	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●
En los programas de estudio	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●
En los textos educativos	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●
Rol que ocupa el indígena en las imágenes de los textos educativos	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●
Número de indígenas en las imágenes de los textos educativos	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●
Existencia de bibliografía auxiliar o complementaria sobre la interculturalización y el bilingüismo	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●

Para ver los documentos, haga click en los puntos, en el nombre de las filas o en el nombre de las columnas



I Informe

Anexos, I Informe

II Informe

Anexos, II Informe



Contenidos sobre la Interacción de la Sociedad Civil y el Estado

	Argentina	Bolivia	Brasil	Colombia	Costa Rica	Chile	Ecuador	El Salvador	Guatemala	Haití	México	Nicaragua	Panamá	Paraguay	Perú	Rep. Dominicana	Suriname	Uruguay	Venezuela
Rol de la sociedad civil en el proceso de elaboración del currículo	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●
Contenidos en los que se promueva el conocimiento y/o la participación de la sociedad civil en los programas de estudios	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●
Contenidos en los que se promueva el conocimiento y/o la participación de la sociedad civil en los textos educativos	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●	●

Para ver los documentos, haga click en los puntos, en el nombre de las filas o en el nombre de las columnas
 